

**HBHE 610: Issues in Public Health Ethics**  
**Fall 2010**  
**Credit Hours: 3**  
**Hours: Mondays & Wednesdays, 1:00-2:30 pm**  
**Room 2695, Crossroads**

**Instructor:** Scott Roberts, PhD  
**Office:** Room 3854, SPH I  
**Phone:** (734) 936-9854  
**Fax:** (734) 763-7379  
**E-mail:** [jscottr@umich.edu](mailto:jscottr@umich.edu)  
**Office hours:** Available by appointment

**Course description:** This course will survey a range of issues in public health ethics. The first part of the course will provide an introduction to key ethical frameworks and concepts relevant to public health, and it will describe the overlap and distinctions between public health and medical ethics. The rest of the course will use a case-based approach to considering ethical dilemmas in several domains, including the following: 1) resource allocation and distributive justice; 2) conflicts between individual rights and the common good; 3) health promotion & disease prevention; 4) human subjects research; and 5) genetics and genomics. The course will use a blend of lectures and group discussions to consider topics of interest. Students will play an active role in researching, presenting, and writing up case studies that will be used to illustrate ethical concepts and conflicts and to facilitate class discussion.

**Course objectives:** By the end of this course, students should have: 1) Gained familiarity with a broad range of ethical issues pertinent to public health in the United States and abroad; 2) Learned how to apply ethical frameworks and concepts to various dilemmas faced in public health and health care settings; 3) Developed an understanding of important historical and present day cases marked by ethical conflicts; and 4) Enhanced written and oral presentation skills involved in ethical analysis.

**Readings:** All readings will be available on the course's C-Tools site. No books or coursepack are required to be purchased.

**Grading:** Students will be evaluated on the following:

- 1) General participation (10%). Students will be expected to regularly attend class, complete all assigned readings, and actively participate in class discussions.
- 2) C-Tools participation (20%). Students are expected to engage in consideration of course topics outside of class through the on-line C-Tools course website. Students are required to 1) respond to an assigned course reading and corresponding discussion questions on three specified occasions within the course website's Forums section; 2) make three separate independent contributions to the site's Forums or Discussion boards in response to course materials; and 3) comment on one news story with implications for public health ethics in the site's "Public Health Ethics in the News" thread (located within the Discussion section). Additional guidelines for C-Tools participation are provided in a separate document.
- 3) Group presentation (25%). At the outset of the semester, students will be assigned in groups to address one of the Group Presentation topics in the course. On their assigned week, the group will be responsible for an hour long session in which they 1) provide a formal presentation

on their topic, offering background details are provided and highlighting ethical conflicts; and 2) facilitate a classroom discussion of the ethical issues raised by their particular topic. Additional guidelines for this assignment are provided in a separate document in C-Tools, and each student group is encouraged to meet with the instructor for suggestions regarding strategies for the presentation and additional readings on their topic.

4) Completion and critique of NIH Human Participant Protection training (10%). Students will complete the on-line training program in clinical research required for NIH-funded researchers. Afterwards, they will submit a written critique of the program (additional assignment details on C-Tools). The website can be accessed at <http://phrp.nihtraining.com/users/login.php>. This assignment will be **due Friday, November 19**.

5) Final project (35%). Students have two options for the final project, either on a topic of the student's choosing. Option A is to develop an ethical analysis of a case study relevant to public health, while Option B is to develop a public health ethics education tool. The instructor will provide a list of suggested topics and options for the format of the assignment. This assignment will be **due at semester's end on Tuesday, December 14**. Additional details are provided in a separate document on C-Tools.

### **Statement on Academic Integrity**

To promote academic integrity, the faculty of the School of Public Health believes that the conduct of a student registered or taking courses in the School should be consistent with that of a professional person. Courtesy, honesty, and respect should be shown by students toward faculty members, guest lecturers, administrative support staff, and fellow students. Similarly, students should expect faculty to treat them fairly, showing respect for their ideas and opinions and striving to help them achieve maximum benefits from their experience in the School.

Student academic misconduct refers to behavior that may include plagiarism, cheating, fabrication, falsification of records or official documents, intentional misuse of equipment or materials (including library materials), and aiding and abetting the perpetration of such acts. The preparation of reports, papers, and examinations, assigned on an individual basis, must represent each student's own effort. Reference sources should be indicated clearly. The use of assistance from other students or aids of any kind during a written examination, except when the use of aids such as electronic devices, books or notes has been approved by an instructor, is a violation of the standard of academic conduct.

### **Statement on Accommodations**

Some students may require special accommodations due to learning disabilities, religious practices, physical requirements, medical needs, or other reasons. Please notify the instructor if you are in need of such accommodations.

## COURSE OUTLINE

### I. Introduction & Background

Ethical concepts and frameworks  
Defining public health ethics  
Regulation and oversight  
Culture & religion  
Ethical issues in public health practice

### II. Resource allocation/distributive justice

Poverty, race and health disparities  
Health care priority-setting  
Political ideology and resource allocation  
Personal responsibility for health

### III. Individual rights vs. common good

Infectious disease control  
Mandatory vaccinations in early childhood  
Driving and injury prevention

### IV. Health promotion/disease prevention

Smoking and tobacco control  
Obesity  
Population-based screening  
Social and commercial marketing

### V. Research ethics

History and overview  
Tuskegee Syphilis Study  
Conflicts of interest  
Enhancing public trust in research  
Research with underresourced populations

### VI. Genomics and Public Health

Overview  
Genomic information and privacy

## KEY DATES

Assignment	Due Date
Group Presentations (9 total)	October 11, 20, 27; November 1, 3, 10, 15; December 1, 8
Assigned C-Tools Forum Responses (9 total across 3 groups)	Kant group: September 20, October 13, November 17 Mill group: September 22, October 25, November 29 Rawls group: September 29, November 8, December 6
Research Ethics Assignment	November 19
Final Paper	December 14

## **UNIT ONE: INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND**

### **Introduction to the Course (September 8)**

Bayer R et al. Introduction: Ethical theory and public health. In: R Bayer et al, Eds. *Public Health Ethics*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2007. p. 3-24.

Kass NE. Public health ethics: From foundations and frameworks to justice and global public health. *Journal of Law, Medicine & Ethics* 2004;32:232-42.

### **Ethical Concepts and Frameworks (September 13)**

Beauchamp DE. Public health as social justice. In: R Hofrichter, Ed. *Health and social justice*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2003, pp. 267-84.

Coughlin SS. How many principles for public health ethics? *The Open Public Health Journal* 2008;1:8-16.

### **Defining Public Health Ethics (September 15)**

Public Health Leadership Society. *Principles of the Ethical Practice of Public Health, Version 2.2*. Public Health Leadership Society, 2002.

Rothstein MA. Rethinking the meaning of public health. *Journal of Law, Medicine & Ethics* 2002;30:144-49.

### **In-class discussion topic**

Sullum J. What the doctor orders. *Priorities* 1996;8(2):8-16. [See also guest commentaries in response to Sullum in "Life, Liberty, and Public Health: A Symposium"]

\*GROUP ASSIGNMENTS MADE FOR IN-CLASS PRESENTATIONS AND ONLINE FORUMS\*

### **Regulation and Oversight (September 20)**

Gostin LO, Stone L. Health of the people: The highest law? In: Dawson A, Verweij M, Eds. *Ethics, prevention and public health*. Oxford: Oxford University Press; 2007. p. 59-77.

Michaels D, Monforton C. Manufacturing uncertainty: Contested science and the protection of the public's health and environment. *American Journal of Public Health* 2005;95:S39-48.

Karnani A. The case against corporate social responsibility. *Wall Street Journal* 2010 (Aug 23).

### **CTools discussion assignment #1 (Kant group)**

Calabresi M, Park A. After Avandia: Does the FDA have a drug problem? *Time* [Internet]; 2010 (August 12).

### **Culture and Religion (September 22)**

Morone JA. Morality, politics, and health policy. In: D Mechanic et al, Eds. *Policy Challenges in Modern Health Care*. New Jersey: Rutgers University Press, 2005, pp. 13-25.

Specter M. The denialists. *New Yorker* 2007 (March 12):32-38.

### **CTools discussion assignment #2 (Mill group)**

Banks AM. Conscience clauses not just about abortion anymore. *USA Today* [Internet]. 2009 (October 24).

Lupu I, Tuttle RW, Masci D. Tensions between rights of conscience and civil rights. *Pew Forum on Religion and Public Life* [Internet]; 2010 (June 3).

### **Ethical Issues in Public Health Practice (September 27)**

**Guest speaker: Nancy Baum, PhD, MHS, Department of Health Management and Policy, University of Michigan School of Public Health**

Baum N et al. Ethical issues in public health practice in Michigan. *American Journal of Public Health* 2009;99:369-374.

Coughlin SS, Barrett DH, Dixon RE. Organizational ethics and public health practice. In: Coughlin SS, *Ethics in Epidemiology & Public Health Practice (2<sup>nd</sup> edition)*. Washington DC: American Public Health Association, 2009. p. 81-92.

MacQueen KM, Buehler JW. Ethics, practice and research in public health. *American Journal of Public Health* 2004;94:928-31.

## **UNIT TWO: RESOURCE ALLOCATION & DISTRIBUTIVE JUSTICE**

### **Poverty, Race & Health Disparities (September 29)**

Dwyer J. Teaching global bioethics. *Bioethics* 2003;17:432-46.

Daniels N. *Just Health*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2007. Chapter 1, Three questions of justice. p. 11-28.

#### C-Tools discussion assignment #3 (Rawls group)

Singer P. The Singer solution to world poverty. *New York Times* [Internet]. 1999; September 5.

## **SPH Symposium on “Health and Human Rights” (October 4): NO CLASS**

### **Health Care Priority Setting, Part I (October 6)**

**Guest speaker: Susan Goold, MD, MHSA, MA, Associate Professor of Internal Medicine & Health Management & Policy, UM Schools of Medicine & Public Health**

Michaelis AP. Priority-setting ethics in public health. *Journal of Public Health Policy* 2002;23:399-412.

Singer P. Why we must ration health care. *The New York Times* [Internet]. 2009; July 15.

#### In-class discussion exercise

Choosing Healthcare Plans All Together (CHAT): <http://chat-health.org/chat/index2.html>

### **Health Care Priority Setting, Part II (October 11)**

Bodenheimer T. The Oregon Health Plan—Lessons for the nation. *New England Journal of Medicine* 1997;337:651-55.

Clarke CM. Rationing scarce life-sustaining resources on the basis of age. *Journal of Advanced Nursing* 2001;35:799-804.

#### Group presentation #1: Health care rationing at the end of life

Gawande A. Letting go: Rethinking end-of-life treatment. *New Yorker* [Internet]; 2010: August 2.

Navasky M, O'Connor K. *Living Old* [Documentary]. Boston: WGBH/Frontline, 2006. Chapter 5, Deciding when enough is enough.

### **Political Ideology and Resource Allocation (October 13)**

Santelli JS. Abstinence-only education: Politics, science, and ethics. *Social Research* 2006;73:835-58.

Scott C. Belief in a just world: A case study in public health ethics. *Hastings Center Report* 2008;38:16-19.

### **C-Tools discussion assignment #4 (Kant group)**

Haidt J, Graham J. When morality opposes justice: Conservatives have moral intuitions that liberals may not recognize. *Social Justice Research* 2007; 20:98-116.

### **Fall Break (October 18)—NO CLASS**

### **Personal Responsibility for Health (October 20)**

Aleccia J. Health reform idea: Put down the doughnut. *MSNBC* [Internet]; 2009 (August 10).

Leichter HM. "Evil habits" and "personal choices": Assigning responsibility for health in the 20<sup>th</sup> century. *Milbank Quarterly* 2003;81:603-26.

Wikler D. Who should be blamed for being sick? *Health Education Quarterly* 1987;14:11-25.

### **Group presentation #2: West Virginia's Medicaid Plan**

Steinbrook R. Imposing personal responsibility for health. *New England Journal of Medicine* 2006;355:753-56.

## **UNIT THREE: INDIVIDUAL RIGHTS VERSUS THE COMMON GOOD**

### **Infectious Disease Control, Part I (October 25)**

Bayer R. Ethics and infectious disease control: STDs, HIV, TB. In: Jennings B, Kahn J, Mastroianni A, Parker LS, Eds. *Ethics and public health: Model curriculum*. Washington DC: Association of Schools of Public Health, 2003. p. 133-46.

Smith CB et al. Are there characteristics of infectious disease that raise special ethical issues? *Developing World Bioethics* 2004;4:1-16.

### **CTools discussion assignment #5 (Mill group)**

Allen A, Colgrove J, Gaul M. Debating use of the HPV vaccine [Radio broadcast]. Washington, DC: National Public Radio, 2007 (March 16).

Schwartz J. HPV vaccination's second act: Promotion, competition, and compulsion. *American Journal of Public Health* Published online ahead of print August 19, 2010.

### **Infectious Disease Control, Part II (October 27)**

Jennings B. Disaster planning and public health. In: Crowley M, Ed. *From Birth to Death and Bench to Clinic: The Hastings Center Bioethics Briefing Book for Journalists, Policymakers, and Campaigns*. New York: The Hastings Center, 2008. p. 41-44.

Thompson AK, Faith K, Gibson JL, Upshur REG. Pandemic influenza preparedness: An ethical framework to guide decision-making. *BMC Medical Ethics* 2006;7:12-23.

Group presentation #3: The Andrew Speaker TB case

Selgelid MJ. Ethics, globalization and tuberculosis. *Public Health Ethics* 2008;1:10-20.

### **Mandatory Vaccinations in Early Childhood (November 1)**

Diekema DS, Marcuse EK. Ethical issues in the vaccination of children. In Burgio GE, Lantos GD, Eds. *Primum Non Nocere Today*. Amsterdam: Elsevier, 1998. p. 37-47.

Fisher BL. In the wake of vaccines. *Mothering* 2004;126 (September/October).

Group presentation #4: Parental rights and child vaccination

Palfreman J. The vaccine war [Documentary]. *Frontline*. Boston: WGBH, 2010.

### **Driving and Injury Prevention (November 3)**

Fain MJ. Should older drivers have to prove that they are able to drive? *Archives of Internal Medicine* 2003;163:2126-2128.

Jones MM, Bayer R. Paternalism and its discontents: Motorcycle helmet laws, libertarian values, and public health. *American Journal of Public Health* 2007;97:208-17.

Group presentation #5: Driving while distracted: Cellphone bans and restrictions

The Editors. Should cellphone use by drivers be illegal? *The New York Times*; 2009 (July 18).

## **UNIT FOUR: HEALTH PROMOTION & DISEASE PREVENTION**

### **Smoking and Tobacco Control (November 8)**

Fox B. Framing tobacco control efforts within an ethical context. *Tobacco Control* 2005;14:38-44.

Voigt K. Smoking and social justice. *Public Health Ethics* 2010;3(2):91-106.

C-Tools discussion assignment #6 (Rawls group)

Schorr D et al. Smoke in the eye. *Frontline*. Boston: WGBH, 1996 (April 2).

### **Obesity and Public Health (November 10)**

McArdle M. America's moral panic over obesity (Campos interview). *The Atlantic* [Internet]; 2009 (July).

Kersh R, Morone JA. The politics of obesity: Seven steps to government action. *Health Affairs* 2002;21(6):142-53.

Group presentation #6: Taxes and bans on unhealthy foods

Nestle M, Jacobson MF. Halting the obesity epidemic: A public health policy approach. *Public Health Reports* 2000;115:12-24.

### **Population-Based Screening (November 15)**

Andermann A, Blancquaert I, Beauchamp S, Déry V. Revisiting Wilson and Jungner in the genomic age: A review of screening criteria over the past 40 years. *Bulletin of the World Health Organization* 2008;86(4): 317–319.

Baily MA, Murray TH. Ethics, evidence and cost in newborn screening. *The Hastings Center Report* 2008;38(3): 23-31.

Group presentation #7: Current controversies in cancer screening

Cancer society warns against premature screening [TV news broadcast]. *PBS Newshour* 2009 (October 21).

### **Social and Commercial Marketing (November 17)**

Almasi EA, Stafford RS, Kravitz RL, Mansfield PR. What are the public health effects of direct-to-consumer drug advertising? *PLoS Medicine* 2006;3:284-88.

Brenkert GG. Ethical challenges of social marketing. *Journal of Public Policy and Marketing* 2002;21:14-25.

C-Tools discussion assignment #7 (Kant group)

Specter M. *Denialism*. New York: Penguin Press, 2009. Chapter 4, The era of echinacea; p. 147-85.

\*NIH HUMAN PARTICIPANT PROTECTION TRAINING & CRITIQUE DUE 11/19\*

## **UNIT FIVE: RESEARCH ETHICS**

### **Ethics in Human Subjects Research: A Brief Overview and History (November 22)**

Buchanan DR, Miller FG. A public health perspective on research ethics. *Journal of Medical Ethics* 2006;32:729-33.

Emanuel EJ et al. What makes clinical research ethical? *JAMA* 2000;283:2701-11.

In-class discussion topic

Fost N, Levine RJ. The dysregulation of human subjects research. *JAMA* 2007;298:2196-98.

Note: The *Belmont Report* (1979) is also provided on CTools as a background reference

### **The Tuskegee Syphilis Study and Its Aftermath (November 24)**

Brandt A. Racism and research: The case of the Tuskegee Syphilis Study. *Hastings Center Report* 1978;8(6):21-29.

Washington HA. *Medical apartheid: The dark history of medical experimentation on black Americans from colonial times to the present*. New York: Doubleday; 2006. Chapter 1, Introduction: The American Janus of medicine and race; p. 1-22.

In-class film viewing and discussion topic

DiAnni D. *The Deadly Deception* [videocassette]. Boston: WGBH, 1993.

### **Conflicts of Interest (November 29)**

Emanuel EJ, Thompson DF. The concept of conflicts of interest. In: Emanuel EJ et al, Eds. *Oxford Textbook of Clinical Research Ethics*. New York: Oxford University Press; 2008. p. 758–766.

Quigley R. Advocacy and community: Conflicts of interest in public health research. In: M Boylan, Ed. *Public Health Policy and Ethics*. Dordrecht: Kluwer, 2004, pp. 223-35.



CTools discussion assignment #8 (Mill group)

Jaschik S. Does tobacco money taint research? *Inside Higher Education* 2006 (September 21).

**Community Engagement and Public Trust in Research (December 1)**

Flicker S et al. Ethical dilemmas in community-based participatory research: Recommendations for Institutional Review Boards. *Journal of Urban Health* 2007;84:478-93.

Minkler M. Ethical challenges for the “outside” researcher in community-based participatory research. *Health Education & Behavior* 2004;31:684-97.

Group presentation #8: The Kennedy Krieger Institute Lead Paint Study

Buchanan DR, Miller FG. Justice and fairness in the Kennedy Krieger Institute Lead Paint Study. *American Journal of Public Health* 2006;96:8-14.

**Public Health Research with Underresourced Populations (December 6)**

Emanuel E, Wendler D, Killen J, Grady J. What makes clinical research in developing countries ethical? The benchmarks of ethical research. *Journal of Infectious Diseases* 2004;189:930-37.

Hyder AA, Merritt MW. Ancillary care for public health research in developing countries. *Journal of the American Medical Association* 2009;302:429-31.

C-Tools discussion assignment #9 (Rawls group)

Jewkes R, Wagman J, Wasunna A. Protecting subjects in a study of domestic violence in South Africa. What services are researchers obligated to provide? In: Lavery JL et al, Eds. *Ethical issues in international biomedical research*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2007. p. 347-59.

**UNIT SIX: GENOMICS & PUBLIC HEALTH**

**Genomics and Public Health, Part I (December 8)**

Barash CI. *Just genes: The ethics of genetic technologies*. Westport CT: Praeger Publishers, 2008. Chapter 1, Justice and genes: A brief historical overview of the relevance of ethics to human genetics; p. 1-27.

Group presentation #9: Direct-to-consumer genetic testing

Tamir S. Direct-to-consumer genetic testing: Ethical–legal perspectives and practical considerations. *Medical Law Review* 2010;18:213-38.

**Genomics and Public Health, Part II (December 13)**

Maschke KJ. Biobanks: DNA and research. In: Crowley M, Ed. *From Birth to Death and Bench to Clinic: The Hastings Center Bioethics Briefing Book for Journalists, Policymakers, and Campaigns*. New York: The Hastings Center, 2008. p. 11-14.

Skloot R. Taking the least of you. *New York Times Magazine* 2006 (April 16).

In-class discussion topic

Erb R. In blood debate, new consent effort aims to open research doors. *Detroit Free Press* [Internet]; 2010 (April 8).

\*FINAL PAPERS DUE BY END OF DECEMBER 14\*