

Credits: 1

Course duration: September 7-October 25, 2010

Meeting Time: Internet-delivered course

Meeting Place: Internet-delivered course

Instructor: Leigh Turner, PhD

Office Address: N520 Boynton, 410 Church Street SE

Office Phone: 612.626.4830

Fax: 612.624.9108

E-mail: turne462@umn.edu

Office Hours: by appointment

TA: Matthew Lamkin

E-mail: lamkin.umn@gmail.com

Office Hours: by appointment

I. Course Description

This course examines ethical frameworks and moral issues related to public health practice and public health policy. The course begins with an introduction to public health ethics frameworks. We then explore various topics falling within the scope of public health ethics. In particular, the course addresses such topics as ethical issues related to severe infectious disease threats; ethical, social, and economic dimensions of health insurance and access to health care; justice and international migration of health care workers; public health, drug safety, and counterfeit pharmaceuticals; health inequities, poverty, and organ trafficking; and public health ethics and “medical tourism”.

II. Course Prerequisites

None.

III. Course Goals and Objectives

This course will better enable students to identify, analyze, and resolve ethical issues related to public health practice and public health policy. Reading assignments, course materials, and writing assignments will help students address complex ethical issues encountered in the practice of public health as well as in public health policy formation. By the end of the course students will have an understanding of major frameworks in public health ethics. Students will also have increased familiarity with key topics in public health ethics. Most importantly, the course will help students use evidence,

reasoning, and argumentation to develop thoughtful responses to complex moral issues related to public health practice and policy making.

IV. Course Assignments and Work Expectations

The course is organized into seven lessons. Each lesson includes assigned readings and related course material. All assigned readings are available in PDF form on the course website. Assignments are listed below:

Lesson One: September 7-September 10; Assignment due Friday, September 10

In Lesson One you are to submit a 250-word post (plus or minus up to 20 words) to the Lesson 1 discussion board. In your post you should introduce yourself to the course instructor and your classmates. You should provide information about your interests, academic background, and long-term career objectives. In the second paragraph of your post you should provide a brief critique of the framework developed by Nancy Kass in her article, “An Ethics Framework for Public Health”. Identify limitations or problems with Kass’ framework and suggest how they might be addressed. Post your contribution to the Lesson 1 discussion board. **Deadline: You must submit your post by 5pm, Friday, September 10. Value: 5% of final grade.**

Lesson Two: September 13-September 17; Assignment due Friday, September 17

During Lesson Two we address the topic: “Healthcare and Healthcare Reform in the U.S.: Ethical Considerations.” Pick one of the assigned readings and summarize the “lessons” it offers for health care reform in the U.S. Do you disagree with any of the author’s claims? If so, identify weaknesses in the author’s arguments. If you agree with the author’s analysis explain why you find it persuasive. Submit your 250-word post (plus or minus up to 20 words) to the Lesson 2 discussion board. **Deadline: You must submit your post by 5pm, Friday, September 17. Value: 5% of final grade.**

Lesson Three: September 20-September 24; Assignment due Friday, September 24

Your assignment for Lesson Three is to write a 1000 word commentary addressing public health ethics issues related to “medical tourism”. In particular, you should identify how medical tourism might promote or harm health equity in such destination nations as India, Thailand, and the Philippines. Use evidence and arguments to develop your analysis. When crafting your commentary you should draw upon assigned readings and use them to support your arguments. Submit your commentary to the course assignment drop box. **Deadline: You must submit your commentary by 5pm, Friday, September 24. Value: 30% of final grade.**

Lesson Four: September 27-October 1; Assignment due Friday, October 1

Draw upon the assigned readings and prepare a brief written response (250 words) addressing the long-term “lessons” of SARS for public health planning. Submit your response to the Lesson 4 discussion board. Your response should address the following questions: What ethical issues are raised by Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome? Building upon the lessons of SARS, how should public health policies respond in an ethical manner to severe infectious disease threats? **Deadline: You must submit your post by 5pm Friday, October 1. Value: 5% of final grade.**

Lesson Five: October 4-October 8; Assignment due October 8

Comparatively wealthy countries such as Australia, Canada, and the United States are drawing doctors, nurses, and other health care workers from such nations as Botswana, Ghana, India, South Africa, and the Philippines. How might international migration of health care providers affect the public health care systems of the nations from which caregivers are leaving? What ethical issues are raised by international migration of health care professionals? What public policies—local, national, or

international—should be developed in response to global migration of health care providers? Prepare a 1000 word commentary on the subject of public health ethics and international migration of health care professionals. Do not simply provide data or describe socioeconomic dimensions of international migration of health care providers. Develop an ethical analysis, using evidence and arguments to make your points. Submit your commentary to the assignment drop box. **Deadline: You must submit your commentary by 5pm Friday, October 8. Value: 30% of final grade.**

Lesson Six: October 11-October 15; Assignment due Friday, October 15

Read all assigned texts and submit a post (250 words) to the Lesson 6 discussion board. Your post should address the following questions: Should individuals with limited economic resources be permitted to sell a kidney? Based upon your analysis of this week's readings, do kidney sales help individuals escape from poverty? Should markets for kidneys be outlawed or regulated by insisting that organ sellers must be informed of risks and benefits related to having a kidney removed? How should public health practitioners respond to the practice of cross-border organ trafficking? **Deadline: You must submit your post by 5pm Friday, October 15. Value: 5% of final grade.**

Lesson Seven: October 18-October 22; Assignment due Friday, October 22

Countries around the world are faced with the threat of counterfeit medications. What risks do counterfeit medications pose to public health? How is drug safety connected to public health? What ethical issues are raised by the circulation of counterfeit medications? Based upon your assessment of this week's readings, what policies should be implemented to ensure that imported pharmaceuticals are safe and effective? Prepare an 800-word commentary in response to the assigned questions. **Deadline: You must submit your commentary by 5pm Friday, October 22. Value: 20% of final grade.**

Guidelines for Preparing Commentaries:

Remember to integrate relevant course material into your assignments. Commentaries should:

- Be well-constructed and reasoned in a thoughtful, considered manner. You should not simply take a "position" about how particular ethical issues should be addressed. Rather, you should provide reasons, arguments, and evidence in support of your claims.
- You will need to draw upon philosophical frameworks in public health ethics, evidence, and relevant course material while developing arguments, anticipating criticisms, responding to objections, and defending your claims. Assigned course material will help you learn to identify ethical issues, gather relevant evidence, and develop arguments.
- Acknowledge and address moral complexity
- Proceed beyond noting questions and concerns and develop ethical analyses that provide insight into how public health practitioners ought to respond to particular topics
- Focus upon ethical issues generated by particular cases and topics and avoid simply providing an overview of the subject matter and readings. Do not simply repeat arguments made in assigned course material. Rather, use this material to develop your own ethical analysis of assigned topics.

V. Grading Policy:

Your final grade for the course will be determined by how well you complete course requirements. All students must be evaluated on the basis of the same assignments. You will not be allowed to do bonus work to replace missed assignments or improve your grade. Also, you are not allowed to revise or redo assignments to improve your grade. Assignments must be submitted by specified deadlines. Late work will not be accepted unless you contact the instructor before the deadline and receive an extension.

Grades:

A	93-100%	A-	90-92%
B+	87-89%	B	83-86%
B-	80-82%	C+	77-79%
C	73-76%	C-	70-72%
D	60-69%	F	<60%

Incomplete Grade

An incomplete grade is permitted only in cases of exceptional circumstances and following consultation with the instructor. In such cases an “I” grade will require a specific written agreement between the instructor and the student specifying the time and manner in which the student will complete the course requirements. Extension for completion of the work will not exceed one year.

University of Minnesota Uniform Grading and Transcript Policy

A link to the policy can be found at onestop.umn.edu.

Grade Option Change (if applicable)

Students in Master of Public Health programs in the School of Public Health **MUST** take this course for a letter grade and receive at least a B- in order to receive credit towards the MPH degree. Please contact Program Major Coordinator for more information. If applicable, students may change grading options during the initial registration period. Grade option changes can be found at: onestop.umn.edu.

VI. Course Withdrawal

School of Public Health students may withdraw from a course through the second week of the semester without permission. No “W” will appear on the transcript. After the second week, students are required to do the following:

- The student must contact and notify their advisor and course instructor informing them of the decision to withdraw from the course;
- The student must send an email to the SPH Student Services Center (SSC) at sph-ssc@umn.edu. The email must provide the student name, ID#, course number, section number, semester, and year with instructions to withdraw the student from the course, and acknowledgement that the instructor and advisor have been contacted.
- The advisor and instructor must email the SSC acknowledging the student is canceling the course. All parties must be notified of the student’s intent.
- The SSC will complete the process by withdrawing the student from the course after receiving all emails (student, advisor, and instructor). A “W” will be placed and remain on the student transcript for the course.
- After discussion with their advisor and notification to the instructor, students may withdraw up until the eighth week of the semester. There is no appeal process.

Students should refer to the Refund and Drop/Add Deadlines for the particular term at onestop.umn.edu for information and deadlines for withdrawing from a course. As a courtesy, students should notify their instructor and, if applicable, advisor of their intent to withdraw.

Students wishing to withdraw from a course after the noted final deadline for a particular term must contact the School of Public Health Student Services Center at sph-ssc@umn.edu for further information

VII. Student Conduct, Scholastic Dishonesty and Sexual Harassment Policies

Students are responsible for knowing the University of Minnesota, Board of Regents' policy on Student Conduct and Sexual Harassment found at www.umn.edu/regents/polindex.html.

Students are responsible for knowing the University of Minnesota, Board of Regents' policy on student conduct and scholastic dishonesty:

<http://www1.umn.edu/regents/policies/academic/StudentConductCode.pdf>.

Students are responsible for maintaining scholastic honesty in their work at all times. Students engaged in scholastic dishonesty will be penalized, and offenses will be reported to the Office of Student Academic Integrity (OSAI, www.osai.umn.edu). Scholastic dishonesty, as defined by University of Minnesota policy, will result in a grade of "F" or "N" for the entire course. The University's Student Conduct Code defines scholastic dishonesty as "plagiarizing; cheating on assignments or examinations; engaging in unauthorized collaboration on academic work; taking, acquiring, or using test materials without faculty permission; submitting false or incomplete records of academic achievement; acting alone or in cooperation with another to falsify records or to obtain dishonestly grades, honors, awards, or professional endorsement; or altering, forging, or misusing a University academic record; or fabricating or falsifying of data, research procedures, or data analysis."

Plagiarism is an important element of this policy. It is defined as the presentation of another's writing or ideas as your own. Serious, intentional plagiarism will result in a grade of "F" or "N" for the entire course. For more information on this policy please consult University policies and procedures regarding academic integrity: <http://writing.umn.edu/tww/plagiarism/>.

Students must properly attribute and cite others' work in their own writing. For guidelines for correctly citing sources, go to <http://tutorial.lib.umn.edu/> and click on "Citing Sources". Original work is expected in this course. It is unacceptable to hand in assignments for this course for which you receive credit in another course unless by prior agreement with the instructor. Building on a line of work begun in another course or leading to a thesis, dissertation, or final project is acceptable. Consult the instructor if you have questions concerning originality of work and appropriate use of citations.

VIII. Disability Statement

It is University policy to provide, on a flexible and individualized basis, reasonable accommodations to students who have a documented disability (e.g., physical, learning, psychiatric, vision, hearing, or systemic) that may affect their ability to participate in course activities or to meet course requirements. Students with disabilities are encouraged to contact Disability Services to have a confidential discussion of their individual needs for accommodations. Disability Services is located in Suite 180 McNamara Alumni Center, 200 Oak Street. Staff can be reached by calling 612/626-1333 (voice or TTY).

Schedule of Topics and Readings.

Lesson 1: Assignment due September 10

Introduction to Public Health Ethics

- Kass N. 2001. An Ethics Framework for Public Health. *American Journal of Public Health* 91, 11: 1776-1782.
- Childress J, Faden R, Gaare R, Gostin L, Kahn J, Bonnie R, Kass N, Mastroianni A, Moreno J, and Nieburg P. 2002. Public Health Ethics: Mapping the Terrain. *Journal of Law, Medicine & Ethics* 30: 170-178.
- Baum N, Gollust S, Goold S, Jacobson P. 2007. Looking Ahead: Addressing Ethical Challenges in Public Health Practice. *Journal of Law, Medicine & Ethics* Winter: 657-667.

Lesson 2: Assignment due September 17

Healthcare and Healthcare Reform in the U.S.: Ethical Considerations

- Himmelstein J. 2006. Bleeding-Edge Benefits. *Health Affairs* 25, 6: 1656-1663.
- Gawande A. 2009. The Cost Conundrum: What a Texas town can teach us about health care. *The New Yorker*. June 1.
- Hemenway D. 2010. Why We Don't Spend Enough on Public Health. *NEJM* 362: 1657-1658.
- Gostin L, Powers M. 2006. What Does Social Justice Require for the Public's Health? Public Health Ethics and Policy Imperatives. *Health Affairs* 25: 1053-1060.

Lesson 3: Assignment due September 24

"Medical Tourism", Bioethics, and the Global Health Care Bazaar

- Milstein A, and Smith M. 2006. America's New Refugees—Seeking Affordable Surgery Offshore. *New England Journal of Medicine* 355, 16: 1637-1640.
- Meghani Z. 2010. A Robust, Particularist Ethical Assessment of Medical Tourism. *Developing World Bioethics* Eprint.
- Mudur G. 2004. Hospitals in India woo foreign patients. *British Medical Journal* 328: 1338.
- Sengupta A, and Nundy S. 2005. The private health sector in India is burgeoning, but at the cost of public health care. *British Medical Journal* 331: 1157-1158.

Lesson 4: Assignment due October 1

Public Health Ethics: Learning from SARS

- Emanuel E. 2003. The Lessons of SARS. *Annals of Internal Medicine* 139, 7: 589-591.
- Gostin L, Bayer R, Fairchild A. 2003. Ethical and Legal Challenges Posed by Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome: Implications for the Control of Severe Infectious Disease Threats. *JAMA* 290, 24: 3229-3237.
- Naylor C, Chantler C, Griffiths S. Learning From SARS in Hong Kong and Toronto. *JAMA* 291, 20: 2483-2487.
- Lim S, Closson T, Howard G, and Gardam M. 2004. Collateral damage: the unforeseen effects of emergency outbreak policies. *The Lancet Infectious Diseases* 4: 697-703.

Lesson 5: Assignment due October 8

Public Health Ethics and International Migration of Health Care Professionals

- Mills E, Schabas W, Volmink J, Walker R, Ford N, Katabira E, Anema A, Joffres M, Cahn P, and Montaner J. 2008. Should active recruitment of health workers from sub-Saharan Africa be viewed as a crime? *Lancet* 371: 685-688.
- Gostin L. 2008. The International Migration and Recruitment of Nurses: Human Rights and Global Justice. *JAMA* 299, 15: 1827-1829.
- Chaguturu S, and Vallabhaneni S. 2005. Aiding and Abetting—Nursing Crises at Home and Abroad. *New England Journal of Medicine* 353, 17: 1761-1763.
- Ahmad, Omar. 2005. Managing medical migration from poor countries. *British Medical Journal*. 331: 43-45.

Lesson 6: Assignment due October 15

Poverty, Organ Trafficking, and Public Health Ethics

- Radcliffe-Richards J, Daar A, Guttman R, Hoffenberg R, Kennedy I, Lock M, Sells R, Tilney N for the International Forum for Transplant Ethics. 1998. The case for allowing kidney sales. *The Lancet* 351: 1950-1952.
- Goyal M, Mehta R, Schneiderman L, Sehgal A. 2002. Economic and Health Consequences of Selling a Kidney in India. *JAMA* 288, 13: 1589-1593.
- Moazam F, Zaman R, Jafarey A. 2009. Conversations with Kidney Vendors in Pakistan: An Ethnographic Study. *Hastings Center Report* 39, 3: 29-44.
- Mendoza R. 2009. Kidney black markets and legal transplants: Are they opposite sides of the same coin? *Health Policy* 94: 255-265.

Lesson 7: Assignment due October 22

Drug Safety, Counterfeit Pharmaceuticals, and Public Health Ethics

- Schweitzer S. 2008. Trying Times at the FDA—The Challenge of Ensuring the Safety of Imported Pharmaceuticals. *NEJM* 358; 17: 1773-1777.
- Dhalla I, and Detsky A. 2008. Risks and Benefits of Importing Prescription Medications From Lower-Income Countries. *Journal of the American Medical Association* 300: 1453-1455.
- Bogdanich W, and Hooker J. 2007. From China to Panama, a Trail of Poisoned Medicine. *New York Times*. May 6.
- Bogdanich W. 2007. Chinese Chemicals Flow Unchecked Onto World Drug Market. *The New York Times*. October 31.
- Harris G. 2008. The Safety Gap. *The New York Times*. November 2.