

PUBLIC HEALTH ETHICS AND POLICY

MPH Elective Course

3 Credits

Fall 2010

Revised October 5, 2010

Instructor

Audrey R. Chapman, Ph.D.

Healey Professor of Medical Ethics and Humanities

Department of Community Medicine and Healthcare

Suite 260, The Exchange

achapman@uchc.edu

860 679 1590

Room N

Description

The starting point of public health ethics is promoting the general health and well-being of communities rather than protecting the dignity and freedom of individuals as in bioethics. A public health perspective assumes background principles of community, justice, and equity but these principles can be difficult to interpret and to apply. The goal of protecting the public's health also raises fundamental questions about when to impose restrictions on the freedom of individuals to protect the health of the community and the duties and obligations owed by citizens to the wider community. This course will cover ethical issues related to the normative grounding of public health policy and to ethical dilemmas in how to apply them in formulating health policy on specific issues.

Class Format

The course will be taught as a seminar with student participation in discussions strongly encouraged and an important component of student evaluation and grading.

Papers and Class Project

In place of a mid-term exam, students will be assigned at three stages of the course a take home exam/short paper (3 to 5 pages). The questions will be based on issues covered in lectures. The objective will be for students to think through their own views and articulate them.

Students will also choose a specific public health ethics topic with the approval of the instructor and will make an oral presentation in one of the final two classes. Topics are due by October 12. An outline (approximately 2-3 pages) and list of resources will be due on November 9. Papers based on the presentation will be due on December 7.

Grading

Class participation 20%

Three short take home questions 35% (10% for two and 15% for the third)

Topic presentation 15%

Final paper 30%

Text and Written Resources

The course will use the *Public Health Ethics: Theory, Policy, and Practice* edited by Ronald Bayer, Lawrence Gostin, Bruce Jennings and Bonnie Steinbock. Readings in the text will be supplemented with articles posted on blackboard.

Learning Objectives

1. Understand the differences between the normative framework for bioethics and public health ethics

Competency

Describe the legal & ethical bases for public health & health services (ASPH D2) (MPH 7)

Core Area

Health Policy and Management

Distinguish between population and individual ethical considerations in relationship to benefits, costs, and burdens of public health programs (ASPH J8)

Professionalism

2. Assess the strengths & limitations of various ethical groundings & frameworks for public health ethics

Identify basic theories, concepts & models from a range of social & behavioral disciplines that are used in public health research & practice (ASPH E1) (MPH 12)

Social and Behavioral Sciences

3. Evaluate the role of justice and equity considerations in public health policy

Describe the merits of social and behavioral interventions and policies (ASPH E7) MPH 12

Social and Behavioral Sciences

Apply social justice and human rights principles when addressing community needs (ASPH H8)

Leadership

4. Apply ethical principles to a variety of complex public health issues	Apply ethical principles to public health planning, implementation and evaluations (ASPH E 9) (MPH 7)	Social and Behavioral Sciences Health Policy and Management
	Promote high standards personal & organizational integrity, compassion, honesty & respect for all people (ASPH J5)	Professionalism

Class Schedule

(1) August 31: Ethical Core of Public Health Perspective

Required Reading

- Beauchamp, “Community: The Neglected Tradition of Public Health,” in *Public Health Ethics*, pp.45-56.
- Rothstein, “Rethinking the Meaning of Public Health,” in *Public Health Ethics*, pp. 71-84.
- Kass, “An Ethical Framework for Public Health,” on blackboard

Optional Reading

- APHA, “Principles of the Ethical Practice of Public Health,” on blackboard
- Gostin, Boufford, and Martinez, “The Future of the Public’s Health: Vision, Values, and Strategies,” in *Public Health Ethics*, pp. 57-70.

(2) September 7: Normative Groundings and Dilemmas

Required Reading

- Bayer, Gostin, et al., “Introduction: Ethical Theory and Public Health,” in *Public Health Ethics*, pp. 3-24.
- Wilson, “Towards a Normative Framework for Public Health Ethics and Policy” on blackboard
- Jennings, “Public Health and Liberty,” on blackboard.
- London, “What Is A Human Rights-Based Approach to Health and Does It Matter?” on blackboard.

Optional Reading

- Radoilska, “Public Health Ethics and Liberalism,” on blackboard.
- Munthe, “Goals of Public Health,” on blackboard.
- Mechanic and Tanner, “Vulnerable People, Groups, and Populations,” on blackboard.

(3) September 14 Autonomy and Paternalism: Policies on Smoking, Drugs, and Alcohol Consumption

Required Readings

- Holland, “Public Health Paternalism,” on blackboard
- Wikler, “Who Should Be Blamed for Being Sick,” in *Public Health Ethics*, pp. 89-104
- Goodin, “No Smoking: The Ethical Issues,” in *Public Health Ethics*, pp. 117-126.
- Sullum, “For Your Own Good: The Anti-Smoking Crusade and the Tyranny of Public Health,” *Public Health Ethics*, pp. 127-134.
- Nadelmann, “Drug Prohibition in the United States: Costs, Consequences and Alternatives,” *Public Health Ethics*, pp. 135-150.

Optional Readings

- Wilson, “Against the Legalization of Drugs,” *Public Health Ethics*, pp. 151-166.
- Voigt, “Smoking and Social Justice,” on blackboard
- Walker, “Why We Should Not Set a Minimum Price Per Unit of Alcohol,” on blackboard

(4) September 21: Justice, Equity, and Fairness

Required Reading

- Deaton, “Policy Implications of the Gradient of Health and Wealth,” in *Public Health Ethics*, pp. 171-186.
- Wilkinson, “Putting the Picture Together: Prosperity, Redistribution, Health, and Welfare,” in *Public Health Ethics*, pp. 187-204.
- Daniels, Kennedy, and Kawachi, “Why Justice is Good for Our Health,” in *Public Health Ethics*, pp. 205-230.
- Mechanic and Tanner, “Vulnerable People, Groups, and Populations: A Societal View,” on blackboard.
- Capewell & Graham, “Will Cardiovascular Disease Prevention Widen Health Inequalities?” on blackboard

Optional Reading

- Wilkinson and Pickett, “Income Inequality and Population Health: A Review and Explanation of the Evidence,” on blackboard
- Norheim, “Implementing the Marmot Commission’s Recommendations,” on blackboard.
- Pappas, “Elucidating Relationship between Race, Socioeconomic Status and Health,” on blackboard.
- Kawachi et al., “Health Disparities by Race and Class,” on blackboard.

(5) September 28: Ethical Implications of the Social Determinants of Health

Required Reading

- (CSDH) Commission on the Social Determinants of Health, *Closing the gap in a generation: Health equity through action on the social determinants of health*, Executive Summary, on blackboard.
- Marmot et al., “Closing the gap in a generation: health equity through action on the social determinants of health,” on blackboard.
- Blas et al., “Addressing social determinants of health inequities: What can the state and civil society do?” on blackboard.

Optional Reading

- London, “Issues of equity are also issues of rights”: Lessons from experience in Southern Africa,” on blackboard
- Commission on the Social Determinants of Health, *Closing the gap in a generation: Health equity through action on the social determinants of health*, full report
- Robert Wood Johnson Foundation, *Beyond Health Care: New Directions to a Healthier America*, executive summary on blackboard

(6) October 5: Ethical Issues Related to Health Resource Priority Setting, Allocation, and Rationing

Required Reading

- Sabik and Lie, “Priority Setting in Health Care: Lessons from the Experience of Eight Countries,” on blackboard.
- Singer, “Why We Must Ration Healthcare,” on blackboard.
- Dey and Fraser, “Age-Based Rationing,” on blackboard.
- Bodenheimer, “The Oregon Health Plan – Lessons for the Nation,” Part I, on blackboard

Optional Reading

- Gruskin and Daniels, “Process is the Point: Justice and Human Rights: Priority Setting and Fair Deliberative Process,” on blackboard.
- Tauber, “Ethics of Rationing,” on blackboard.
- Allen & Alvarez, “Threshold Considerations in Fair Allocation of Health Resources, on blackboard.
- Fenton, “Making Fair Funding Decisions for High Cost Cancer Drugs,” on blackboard.
- Iglehart, “The Political Fight Over Comparative Effectiveness Research,” on blackboard
- Oberlander, “Rationing Medical Care: Rhetoric and Reality in the Oregon Health Plan,” on blackboard

(7) October 12: Public Health Ethics and Health Institutions and Laws

Required Reading

- Raphael and Bryant, “The state’s role in promoting population health: Public health concerns in Canada, USA, United Kingdom, and Sweden,” on blackboard
- Angell, “Privatizing Health Care Is Not the Answer,” on blackboard
- Burris, Wagenaar, et al, “Making the Case for Laws that Improve Health,” on blackboard
- Filho and Furio, “A Human Rights Approach to Quality of Life and Health: Application to Public Health Programming,” on blackboard
- Nuffield Trust, “Reforming health care: why we need to learn from international experience,” on blackboard
- Gostin, “The National Health Insurance Mandate,” on blackboard

Optional Reading

- Rasanathan et al., Primary health care and the social determinants of health,” on blackboard

- Mackintosh And Kovalev, “Commercialisation, Inequalities, and Transitions in Health Care,” on blackboard
- Toebes, “The Right to Health and the Privatization of National Health Systems: The Case of the Netherlands,” on blackboard
- Chapman, “The Ethics of Patenting Human Embryonic Stem Cells,” on blackboard
- WHO, “Public Health, Innovation, and Intellectual Property,” on blackboard
- Gladwell, “High Prices,” on blackboard
- Saenz, “What Is Affordable Health Insurance?” on blackboard

(8) October 19: Infectious Diseases, Vaccination, and Public Health Emergencies as Public Health Ethics Issues

Required readings

- Bayer and Fairchild, “Surveillance and Privacy,” in *Public Health Ethics*, pp. 255-260.
- Gostin et al., “Ethical and Legal Challenges Posed by Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome,” in *Public Health Ethics*, pp. 261-278.
- Diekema and Marcuse, “Ethical Issues in the Vaccination of Children,” in *Public Health Ethics*, pp. 279-288.
- Berkman, “Incorporating Explicit Ethical Reasoning into Pandemic Influenza Policy,” on blackboard.
- Kayman, “Revisiting Public Health Preparedness,” on blackboard

Optional Reading

- Malm, May, Francis, et al., “Ethics, Pandemics, and the Duty to Treat,” on blackboard
- Baum, Jacobson, et.al., “Listen to the People: Public Deliberation About Social Distancing Measures in a Pandemic,” on blackboard,
- Omer, et al. “Mandatory Vaccination, and the Risks of Vaccine Preventable Diseases,” on blackboard
- CT Public Health Emergency Response Act, on blackboard

(9) October 26: Globalization and Global Health Justice

Required Reading

- Labonté and Schrecker, “Introduction: Globalization’s Challenges to People’s Health,” on blackboard
- Labonté and Schrecker, “Rights, Redistribution, and Regulation,” on blackboard
- Schrecker, “Denaturalizing scarcity: a strategy of enquiry for public health ethics,” on blackboard
- Horton, “Global science and social movements: Towards a rational politics of global health,” on blackboard
- Lowry et al, , “Two Models in Global Health Ethics,” on blackboard
- Gostin, “Meeting the Survival Needs of the World’s Poorest Populations,” on blackboard

Optional Reading

- Sassen, “Bordering Capabilities Versus Borders: Implications for National Borders

- Sassen, “A Savage Sorting of Winners and Losers: Contemporary Versions of Primitive Accumulation,” on blackboard
- Smith, Correa, et al., “Trade TRIPS, and Pharmaceuticals,” on blackboard.
- Prah Ruger, “Global Health Justice” on blackboard.

(10) November 2: There will be no class.

(11) November 9: Public Health Ethics Perspective on Genetic Testing and Therapy

Required Reading

- Burris and Gostin, “Genetic Screening from a Public Health Perspective: Three ‘Ethical’ Principles,” in *Public Health Ethics*, pp.357-369.
- Sankar, Cho et al., “Genetic Research and Health Disparities,” in *Public Health Ethics*, pp.392-402.
- Clayton, “The Complex Relationships of Genetics, Groups, and Health: What It Means for Public Health,” in *Public Health Ethics*, pp. 377-390.
- Matloff and Caplan, “Direct to Confusion: Lessons Learned from Marketing BRCA Testing,” on blackboard
- Benn and Chapman, “Ethical Challenges in Providing Noninvasive Prenatal Diagnosis,” on blackboard.
- GAO, “Direct to Consumer Genetic Tests,” on blackboard.

Optional Reading

- Baily and Murray, “Ethics, Evidence, and Cost in Newborn Screening,” on blackboard.
- Frankel and Chapman, “Facing Inheritable Genetic Modification,” on blackboard

(12) November 16: Ethics of Controversial New Technologies

Required Readings

- Caulfield and Chapman, “Human Dignity as a Criterion for Science Policy,” on blackboard
- John A. Robertson, “Embryo Stem Cell Research: Ten Years of Controversy,” on blackboard.
- President’s Council on Bioethics, *Beyond Therapy: Biotechnology and the Pursuit of Happiness*, full report is on blackboard, see particularly chapter 6, pp. 275-310
- National Bioethics Advisory Commission, *Cloning Human Beings*, chapter 4, on blackboard

Optional Reading

- National Bioethics Advisory Commission, *Cloning Human Beings*, chapter 5, Law & Policy, on blackboard
- Murdoch, “Stem Cell Tourism and the Power of Hope,” on blackboard
- Cohen and Cohen, “International Stem Cell Tourism and the Need for Effective Regulation,” on blackboard

November 23: Ethics of Measurement in Health Evaluation

Required Reading

- Arnesen and Nord, “The value of DALY life: problems with ethics and validity of disability adjusted life years,” on blackboard
- Anand and Hanson, “Disability-Adjusted Life Years: A Critical Review,” on blackboard
- Morgan and Ziglio, “Revitalizing the Public Health Evidence Base,” on blackboard
- Sreenevasan, “Ethics and Epidemiology,” on blackboard
- Garber, “The Role of Costs in Comparative Effectiveness Research”
- Baird, “The New NIH and FDA Medical Research Policies: Targeting Gender, Promoting Justice,” on blackboard

Optional Reading

- Graham, “What Is the Future in Public Health,” on blackboard
- Rose, “Sick Individuals and Sick Populations,” in *Public Health Ethics*, pp. 33-44.
- Brock, “Ethical Issues in Applying Quantitative Models for Setting Priorities in Prevention,” on blackboard
- Coughlin, “Ethical Issues in Epidemiological Research,” on blackboard

November 30: Class presentations

December 7: Class presentations