

Ethical Issues in Public Health

306.655.01 | AY 2021-2022 - 2nd Term

Faculty: Anne Barnhill (abarnhi1@jhu.edu)

Course Description: The 2014 Ebola outbreak in West Africa was called a “moral failure.” The former mayor of New York City, Michael Bloomberg, has been called a “finger-wagging nanny” because of his public health efforts, such as attempting to ban the sale of some large sugary drinks. What do these claims mean? What are the ethical values and the assumptions about public health underlying claims like these? This course examines these ethical questions and others, as they bear on a range of topics in public health. We will consider the ethical for public health, and consider how the pursuit of public health can come into conflict with important values and ethical concerns, such as individual autonomy, privacy, and social justice.

Course Learning Objectives:

Upon successfully completing this course, students will be able to:

- Identify and consider ethical issues relevant to public health efforts
- Articulate moral arguments for or against different kinds of public health programs and policies
- Use ethical skills to interpret ethical debates about current public health issues

Assignments:

- Weekly discussion sections (50% of final grade): Each week (except for week 1), there will be a discussion question posted on CoursePlus. Prior to the start of class, post a one paragraph answer to that question. Each of these is worth 6.25% of your final grade.
- Final paper (50% of final grade): You will write a paper (at least 8 and no more than 10 pages double-spaced) that gives an ethical analysis of a public health program or policy.

Week 1: Introduction to Public Health Ethics

Required Watching:

These lectures are for public health students who don't have a background in ethics or bioethics. Bioethics students who've viewed these lectures don't need to view them again:

1. Introduction to Bioethics (26 minutes; this lecture has audio). *Much of the content of this course is public health ethics, which is a subfield of bioethics. This lecture gives you a short introduction to bioethics.*

2. Introduction to Principlism (18 minutes; this lecture has audio). *This lecture provides a short introduction to Principlism, which is a methodological approach in bioethics. In this course, we will use an ethical template to analyze public health policies, and this ethical template is based in Principlism.*

These videos provide an introduction to public health, and are for students who don't have a background in public health. Public health students don't need to watch these videos:

1. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, "Introduction to Public Health," <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ZCVPY2fKaTA> (52 minutes). *An introduction to public health, that defines public health, discusses the purpose of public health, describes the core public health functions and services, and identifies some key determinants of public health.*

2. Virginia Berridge, "Public Health: A Very Short Introduction," <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ZCVPY2fKaTA> (4 minutes). *As advertised, this is a *very* short introduction to public health.*

Required Reading:

1. Bazelon, Emily. "Restarting America Means People Will Die. So When Do We Do It?" *The New York Times*, April 10, 2020. <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/04/10/magazine/coronavirus-economy-debate.html>.

2. Travis Rieder, Anne Barnhill, Justin Bernstein and Brian Hutler, "When to Reopen the Nation is an Ethics Question—Not Only a Scientific One," <https://www.thehastingscenter.org/when-to-reopen-the-nation-is-an-ethics-question-not-only-a-scientific-one/> *This short piece argues that when to restart social and economic activity during the COVID-19 pandemic is not just a scientific question or a question for public health to answer, but is an ethical question.*

3. SKIM: Childress J, Faden R, Gaare R, Gostin L, Kahn J, Bonnie R, Kass N, Mastroianni A, Moreno J, Nieburg P. 2002. Public Health Ethics: Mapping the Terrain, *Journal of Law, Medicine and Ethics* 30(2): 170-80. *This modern classic provides a brief introduction to public health ethics and a framework for ethical analysis of public health interventions.*

Optional Watching:

If you are new to ethics, I recommend watching these videos to introduce you to ethics and some specific moral theories:

1. PBS Digital Studios, Metaethics: Crash Course Philosophy #32 (10 minutes)
<https://youtu.be/FOoffXFpAIU>

2. PBS Digital Studios, Kant & Categorical Imperatives: Crash Course Philosophy #35 (10 minutes) <https://youtu.be/8bllys6JoEDw>

3. PBS Digital Studios, Utilitarianism: Crash Course Philosophy #36 (10 minutes) <https://youtu.be/-a739VjqdSI>

4. PBS Digital Studios, Contractarianism: Crash Course Philosophy #37 (10 minutes)
<https://youtu.be/2Co6pNvd9mc>

5. PBS Digital Studios, Aristotle & Virtue: Crash Course Philosophy #38 (10 minutes)
<https://youtu.be/PrvtOWEXDIQ>

Week 2: Communicable Disease, Autonomy and Liberty

NOTE: Starting this week, and for the rest of the term, there will be a discussion question posted here and on the Discussion Board. Prior to the start of class on Tuesday, post a one-paragraph answer to that question. Each of these is worth 6.25% of your final grade.

Weekly writing question: Is it ethical for employers to require their in-person employees to be fully vaccinated against COVID-19, unless they have a medical exemption? Why or why not?

Required Reading:

1. Colgrove J, Bayer R. 2005. "Manifold Restraints: Liberty, Public Health, and the Legacy of *Jacobsen v. Massachusetts*." *American Journal of Public Health* 95(4): 571-576. *Traces the history of what is now a classic tension in public health between individual liberty and the state's interest in promoting individual actions that contribute to overall health of the community.*
2. Ezekiel Emanuel, Matthew Guido and Patricia Hong, "Vaxxed or Axed: To protect patients, every health care worker must be vaccinated," July 14, 2021. <https://www.statnews.com/2021/07/14/vaxxed-or-axed-protect-patients-health-care-vaccine-mandate/>.
3. Lantos, John D, Mary Anne Jackson, Douglas J Opel, Edgar K Marcuse, Angela L Myers, and Beverly L Connelly. "Controversies in Vaccine Mandates." *Curr Probl Pediatr Adolesc Health Care*, 2010, 21. **READ PP. 47-54**
4. OPTIONAL: Gur-Arie, Rachel, Euzebiusz Jamrozik, and Patricia Kingori. "No Jab, No Job? Ethical Issues in Mandatory COVID-19 Vaccination of Healthcare Personnel." *BMJ Global Health* 6, no. 2 (February 2021): e004877. <https://doi.org/10.1136/bmjgh-2020-004877>.

Week 3: Justice and Public Health

Weekly writing question: Should public policy aim to reduce **all** differences in health outcomes across income groups? Why or why not?

Required Reading:

1. Govind Persad, "Justice and Public Health," Chapter 4, pp.33-46, Anna Mastroianni, Jeffrey Kahn and Nancy Kass, editors, *The Oxford Handbook of Public Health Ethics*, OUP, 2019.

This chapter provides a brief introduction to theories of distributive justice and their application in public health.

2. Stephen B. Thomas, "Racial and Ethnic Disparities as a Public Health Ethics Issue" in Anna Mastroianni, Jeffrey Kahn and Nancy Kass, editors, *The Oxford Handbook of Public Health Ethics*, OUP, 2019.

3. SKIM: Braveman, Paula A., Catherine Cubbin, Susan Egerter, David R. Williams, and Elsie Pamuk. "Socioeconomic Disparities in Health in the United States: What the Patterns Tell Us." *American Journal of Public Health* 100, no. S1 (April 2010): S186–96. <https://doi.org/10.2105/AJPH.2009.166082>.

Required watching:

1. Introduction to Justice lecture. ***NOTE: Masters of Bioethics students do not need to watch this lecture. They have seen it before.***

Optional reading and watching:

The following readings and videos provide a basic introduction to structural injustice.

1. Iris Marion Young, "Five Faces of Oppression"

2. Kimberlé Crenshaw, "The urgency of intersectionality" https://www.ted.com/talks/kimberle_crenshaw_the_urgency_of_intersectionality?language=en#t-878576/ (19 minutes) ****Note that this video contains descriptions and depictions of violence that some might find disturbing****

3. Jonathan Wolff, "Structural Injustice," <https://www.birmingham.ac.uk/research/activity/globalethics/news/2018/jonathan-wolff-recording.aspx> (54 minutes)

Week 4: Non-communicable Disease

Weekly writing question: Suppose that you are the leader of a large health care system. Would you adopt a policy of not hiring tobacco users? Why or why not?

Requiring Watching:

1. Introduction to Ethics of NCDs lecture (14 min)

2. Paternalism lecture (44 min)

Required Reading:

1. Bayer R, Moreno J. 1986. "Health Promotion: Ethical and Social Dilemmas of Government Policy." *Health Affairs* 5(2):72-85. *Classic article that reviews key concepts in the ethics of public health policy.*

2. Richard Ashcroft, "Smoking, Health and Ethics," in *Public Health Ethics: Key Concepts and Issues in Policy and Practice*, ed. Angus Dawson (Cambridge University Press, 2011). **Focus on pp. 85-89.**

3. Sarah Conly, "Coercive Paternalism in Health Care: Against Freedom of Choice." *Public Health Ethics* 6, no. 3 (November 1, 2013): 241–45.

4. SKIM: Harald Schmidt, Kristin Voigt, and Ezekiel J. Emanuel. "The Ethics of Not Hiring Smokers." *New England Journal of Medicine* 368, no. 15 (2013): 1369–1371.

4. SKIM: David A. Asch, Ralph W. Muller, and Kevin G. Volpp. "Conflicts and Compromises in Not Hiring Smokers." *New England Journal of Medicine* 368, no. 15 (April 11, 2013): 1369–71.

5. SKIM: Teresa Wiltz, "A New Smoking Ban in Public Housing Roils Some Residents." <https://pew.org/2nJPOht>.

Week 5: Public Health Messaging

Weekly writing question: Is it ethical for public health officials to design messaging that is graphic, disturbing, frightening, or disgusting? Why or why not?

Required Reading:

1. Fairchild, A. L., R. Bayer, and J. Colgrove. Risky Business: New York City's Experience With Fear-Based Public Health Campaigns. *Health Affairs* 34, no. 5 (May 1, 2015): 844–51.

2. Bernheim, Ruth Gaare, and Richard J. Bonnie. "Health Communication." In *Essentials of Public Health Ethics*, by Ruth Gaare Bernheim, James F. Childress, Richard J. Bonnie, and Alan L. Melnick, 193–217. Burlington, MA: Jones & Bartlett Learning, 2015. *****READ ONLY** pp.193-198, pp.206-209 and p.214. You can SKIP "Aggressive Tobacco Control: New Frontiers of the First Amendment", pp. 199-206, and "Empowering Health," pp.210-213)***

3. Elisabeth Rosenthal, "It's Time to Scare People about COVID," *The New York Times*, December 7, 2020

Required Watching:

1. "Cigarettes are eating you alive" [tobacco, NYC]: <https://youtu.be/Hg5m4nXyl3s>

2. [Massachusetts anti-smoking ads](#)

3. "The Real Cost – Your Skin" [tobacco] <https://www.ispot.tv/ad/7BnU/the-real-cost-your-skin>

4. Debi Austin – "Voicebox" [tobacco] - <https://youtu.be/wAaGbsHBacE>

5. "Wear a Mask PSA" [COVID, State of California] <https://youtu.be/qtVQsGKNNgw>

6. "Man Drinking Fat," [sugary drinks] <https://youtu.be/-F4t8zL6F0c>

7. Break the Habit,” [childhood obesity] <https://youtu.be/82kYQ7j7X2s>
8. “Baby Carrots, Eat Em Like Junk Food” [marketing healthy food] https://youtu.be/vCaN28dDa_Q
9. “Living a Healthy Lifestyle,” [Coca-Cola commercial] <https://youtu.be/VStIS7cO2uY>
10. “Under Pressure,” [Coca-Cola commercial] <https://youtu.be/Gn5o4MCDTt8>

Optional Reading:

1. SKIM: Bayer, Ronald. “Stigma and the Ethics of Public Health: Not Can We but Should We.” *Social Science & Medicine* 67, no. 3 (August 2008): 463–72.
2. SKIM: Faden, Ruth. “Ethical Issues in Government Sponsored Public Health Campaigns.” *Health Education & Behavior* 14, no. 1 (January 1, 1987): 27–37.

Week 6: Individual and Collective Responsibility for the Opioid Crisis

Weekly writing question: What are two questions that you would like to ask Brendan Saloner about this week’s topic?

Guest Lecture: Brendan Saloner, PhD Assistant Professor, Department of Health Policy and Management, Johns Hopkins School of Public Health

Required Reading:

1. Keefe, PR. 2017. The Family that Built an Empire of Pain: The Sackler dynasty’s ruthless marketing of painkillers has generated billions of dollars – and millions of addicts. *The New Yorker* October 30, 2017 <https://www.newyorker.com/magazine/2017/10/30/the-family-that-built-an-empire-of-pain>
2. Dasgupta N, Beletsky L, Ciccarone C. 2018. Opioid Crisis: No Easy Fix to Its Social and Economic Determinants. *American Journal of Public Health* 108(2): 182-186.
3. Lurie, Julia. “Empty Promises and Preventable Deaths: Trump’s Bungled Response to Opioids Was a Test Run for COVID.” *Mother Jones* (blog). Accessed October 8, 2020. <https://www.motherjones.com/politics/2020/10/trump-public-health-failures-coronavirus-opioids/>.
4. James, K. and Jordan, A., 2018. The Opioid Crisis in Black Communities. *American Journal of Public Health* 46: 404-421.

Recommended Reading:

1. Satel S, Lilienfeld SO. 2013. Addiction and the Brain-Disease Fallacy. *Frontiers in Psychiatry* 4(141): 1-11.

Week 7: Structural Racism and Health Equity

Weekly writing question: Identify one factor contributing to pregnancy-related death in the United States. Does this factor reflect injustice, in some way? If so, what form or kind of injustice does it reflect?

Required listening or watching:

1. Nina Martin and Renee Montagne, “The Last Person You’d Expect to Die in Childbirth,” May 12, 2017. <https://www.npr.org/2017/05/12/527806002/focus-on-infants-during-childbirth-leaves-u-s-moms-in-danger> (12 minutes)
2. Nina Martin and Renee Montagne, “Black Mothers Keep Dying After Giving Birth.” December 7, 2017. <https://www.npr.org/2017/12/07/568948782/black-mothers-keep-dying-after-giving-birth-shalon-irvings-story-explains-why> (12 minutes)
3. PBS News Hour, “Why are black mothers and infants far more likely to die from pregnancy-related causes?” <https://www.pbs.org/newshour/show/why-are-black-mothers-and-infants-far-more-likely-to-die-in-u-s-from-pregnancy-related-causes> (10 minutes)
4. Renee Montagne, “To Keep Women From Dying In Childbirth, Look To California?: NPR.” July 28, 2019. <https://www.npr.org/2018/07/29/632702896/to-keep-women-from-dying-in-childbirth-look-to-california>. (14 minutes). *This story describes the successful efforts of the California Maternal Quality Care Collaborative to reduce pregnancy-related deaths in hospitals by improving the emergency care offered. They developed protocols -- checklists, “crash carts,” and drills -- for treating complications such as hemorrhage and preeclampsia.*

Required Reading:

1. Bailey, Zinzi D., Justin M. Feldman, and Mary T. Bassett. “How Structural Racism Works — Racist Policies as a Root Cause of U.S. Racial Health Inequities.” Edited by Debra Malina. *New England Journal of Medicine* 384, no. 8 (February 25, 2021): 768–73.
2. Bailey, Zinzi D, Nancy Krieger, Madina Agénor, Jasmine Graves, Natalia Linos, and Mary T Bassett. “Structural Racism and Health Inequities in the USA: Evidence and Interventions.” *The Lancet* 389, no. 10077 (April 2017): 1453–63. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736\(17\)30569-X](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(17)30569-X).
3. Sgaier, Sema K., and Jordan Downey. “Opinion | What We See in the Shameful Trends on U.S. Maternal Health.” *The New York Times*, November 17, 2021. <https://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2021/11/17/opinion/maternal-pregnancy-health.html>
4. Nina Martin, “Redesigning Maternal Care: OB-GYNs Are Urged to See New Mothers Sooner And More Often.” <https://www.npr.org/2018/04/23/605006555/redesigning-maternal-care-ob-gyns-are-urged-to-see-new-mothers-sooner-and-more-o>. *This article describes recommended changes in care for post-partum patients, including having follow-up appointments sooner after birth and providing more individualized and more frequent care.*
5. SKIM: Rakover J. The Maternity Medical Home: The Chassis for a More Holistic Model of Pregnancy Care? Institute for Healthcare Improvement.

2016.. <http://www.ihl.org/communities/blogs/ layouts/15/ihl/community/blog/itemview.aspx?List=7d1126ec-8f63-4a3b-9926-c44ea3036813&ID=222>

6. SKIM: Nina Martin and Julia Belluz, “We’re Investigating How Insurance Gaps Endanger Mothers. This Is Why.” <https://www.propublica.org/article/investigating-how-insurance-gaps-endanger-mothers>
7. SKIM: Howell E et al, Reduction of Peripartum Racial and Ethnic Disparities, A Conceptual Framework and Maternal Safety Consensus Statement. *Obstet and Gynecol* 131, May 2018. https://journals.lww.com/greenjournal/Fulltext/2018/05000/Reduction_of_Peripartum_Racial_and_Ethnic.4.aspx
8. SKIM: Parkekh N, Jarlenski M, and Kelley D. Prenatal and Postpartum Care Disparities in a Large Medicaid Program. *Maternal and Child Health Journal* 2018; 22:429-437.
9. OPTIONAL: Bleich, Sara N., and Jamy D. Ard. “COVID-19, Obesity, and Structural Racism: Understanding the Past and Identifying Solutions for the Future.” *Cell Metabolism* 33, no. 2 (February 2021): 234–41.
10. OPTIONAL: Churchwell, Keith, Mitchell S.V. Elkind, Regina M. Benjamin, April P. Carson, Edward K. Chang, Willie Lawrence, Andrew Mills, et al. “Call to Action: Structural Racism as a Fundamental Driver of Health Disparities: A Presidential Advisory From the American Heart Association.” *Circulation* 142, no. 24 (December 15, 2020).

Week 8: Legitimacy & COVID-19 Policy

Weekly writing question: In a pandemic, should pandemic control policies be crafted by public health officials insulated from political influence? Why or why not?

Required Listening and Watching:

1. The Daily (podcast), “Public Health Officials Under Siege” (29 minutes)
<https://www.nytimes.com/2021/11/11/podcasts/the-daily/coronavirus-public-health.html>
2. WHO Pandemic Ethics and Policy Summit. <https://youtu.be/O-SpMod2vYA>. Watch from the beginning until the end of the first panel (at 1 hour 15 minutes). You can skip the first 7 minutes, if you want.

Required Reading:

1. Rieder, Travis N., Anne Barnhill, Justin Bernstein, and Brian Hutler. “When to Reopen the Nation Is an Ethics Question—Not Only a Scientific One.” The Hastings Center, April 28, 2020. <https://www.thehastingscenter.org/when-to-reopen-the-nation-is-an-ethics-question-not-only-a-scientific-one/>.
2. Bernstein, Justin, Anne Barnhill and Travis Rieder, “How should governments make COVID-19 policy? Bioethicists argue that pandemic policymaking requires science, ethics and politics,” forthcoming in *The Philosopher’s Magazine*

3. Winsberg, Eric, Jason Brennan, and Chris W. Surprenant. "How Government Leaders Violated Their Epistemic Duties During the SARS-CoV-2 Crisis." *Kennedy Institute of Ethics Journal* 30, no. 3–4 (2020): 215–42.
4. Baum, Nancy M., Peter D. Jacobson, and Susan D. Goold. "'Listen to the People': Public Deliberation About Social Distancing Measures in a Pandemic." *The American Journal of Bioethics* 9, no. 11 (November 4, 2009): 4–14.
5. Garrett, J. Eline, Dorothy E. Vawter, Angela Witt Prehn, Debra A. DeBruin, and Karen G. Gervais. "Listen! The Value of Public Engagement in Pandemic Ethics." *The American Journal of Bioethics* 9, no. 11 (November 4, 2009): 17–19.
6. OPTIONAL SKIM: Justin Bernstein, Brian Hutler, Travis Rieder, Ruth Faden, Hahrie Han, Anne Barnhill, "An Ethics Framework for the COVID-19 Reopening Process," 2020. <https://bioethics.jhu.edu/wp-content/uploads/2019/10/FINAL-SNF-Agora-Covid-19.pdf>

Week 9: Vaccine Allocation – COVID-19 Vaccine

This week, we have an **Asynchronous Class**. Class will not meet this week.

You should do these readings, watch these lectures, and answer these questions on your own time. You should post your answers to the questions on the Discussion Board by December 28.

Read these papers:

1. Persad, Govind, Monica E. Peek, and Ezekiel J. Emanuel. "Fairly Prioritizing Groups for Access to COVID-19 Vaccines." *JAMA* 324, no. 16 (October 27, 2020): 1601–
2. <https://doi.org/10.1001/jama.2020.18513>.
2. National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine 2020. Framework for Equitable Allocation of COVID-19 Vaccine. Washington, DC: The National Academies Press. Read the beginning of chapter 3, pp. 89-112.
3. Schmidt, Harald, Lawrence O. Gostin, and Michelle A. Williams. "Is It Lawful and Ethical to Prioritize Racial Minorities for COVID-19 Vaccines?" *JAMA* 324, no. 20 (November 24, 2020): 2023–24. <https://doi.org/10.1001/jama.2020.20571>.

Read at least two of these:

1. Weis, Julia. "73% of Latinos Have At Least 1 COVID-19 Vaccine Shot, But Disparities Persist in Some States." *Salud America*, September 20, 2021. <https://salud-america.org/73-of-latinos-vaccinated-but-disparities-persist/>.
2. Grumbach, Kevin, Mariam Carson, and Orlando O. Harris. "Achieving Racial and Ethnic Equity in COVID-19 Vaccination: From Individual Readiness to Health System Readiness." *JAMA Health Forum* 2, no. 7 (July 30, 2021): e211724. <https://doi.org/10.1001/jamahealthforum.2021.1724>.

3. Liz Hamel et al., "KFF COVID-19 Vaccine Monitor: COVID-19 Vaccine Access, Information, and Experiences Among Hispanic Adults in the U.S." *KFF* (blog), May 13, 2021. <https://www.kff.org/coronavirus-covid-19/poll-finding/kff-covid-19-vaccine-monitor-access-information-experiences-hispanic-adults/>.
4. Stephania Taladrid, "The Struggle to Improve Vaccination Rates Among Latinos in New York." *The New Yorker*, May 22, 2021. <https://www.newyorker.com/news/our-local-correspondents/the-struggle-to-improve-vaccination-rates-among-latinos-in-new-york>.

Watch these pre-recorded lectures:

1. Ethics of Allocating Scarce COVID-19 vaccine, Part 1 (17 min)
2. Ethics of Allocating Scarce COVID-19 vaccine, Part 2: Vaccine Allocation Schemes for the United States (27 min)
3. Ethics of Allocating Scarce COVID-19 vaccine, Part 3: Equity (20 min)

Answer these three questions on the Discussion Board:

Question #1:

Suppose that it is Fall 2020, and you are asked to advise a state about their draft COVID-19 vaccine allocation plan (see below). It is a medium-sized state with a large urban population and a large population of frontline essential workers. State officials ask you if there are any aspects of their vaccination allocation scheme that they should reconsider. What, if anything, would you advise them to reconsider? Why? Write one paragraph in response to this question.

Vaccine Allocation Plan:

The state anticipates that vaccinations will be offered by pharmacies (e.g. CVS stores), in clinical settings (e.g. community health clinics), and at mass vaccination sites. Vaccination appointments will be made on a "first-come, first-served" basis. Vaccine will be distributed to counties within the state on the basis of their population size.

Prioritization Phases:

- 1A: All health care workers in any health care setting who have contact with patients. This category includes health care providers in in-patient and out-patient settings, workers in long-term care facilities, home health aides, pharmacy workers and EMTs.
- 1B: All people ages 75 and above
- 2A: People aged 16+ with underlying health conditions that put them at higher risk of severe COVID-related illness
- 2B: Frontline essential workers
- 3: Vaccine will be made available to all other adults by moving progressively through age brackets. Vaccine will be made available first to people aged 65-74, then people aged 55-64, and so on.
- The state has not included children in its prioritization plan, because the vaccine is not yet approved for use in children.

Question #2: Suppose that the state has some evidence that food processing workers and food retail workers in the state (currently in Phase 2B) have a higher incidence of SARS-CoV-2 and a higher death rate from COVID-19 than any group of health care workers. Should those workers be given higher priority for vaccine than Phase 2B? Why or why not? Do you need more information to decide? If so, what information do you need? Write one paragraph in response to this question.

Question #3. Now suppose that it is April 2020. The state's large Latino population has significantly lower vaccination rates than the population as a whole. The state asks for your input about two matters:

- What is likely causing this disparity in vaccination rates?
- What can the state do to address this disparity? Make one concrete suggestion about what the state might do, and explain why you chose it. See if you can come up with a suggestion that other students have not yet recommended on this discussion thread.

Write one paragraph in response to this question.