

Public Health Ethics PH 200A

Jodi Halpern, MD, Ph.D.

Spring 2018, Thursdays 12-2 pm, 274 Dwinelle

PH200A is a foundational course for developing the methods of ethical reasoning necessary for influencing policy and for writing compelling academic papers and grant applications. We examine the ethical challenges inherent in public health practice, research and policy. The syllabus covers a range of topics in ethics through cases representative of different public health dilemmas. The cases considered include treating homeless people with TB, rationing medical care in the United States, conducting HIV studies of maternal-fetal transmission in Africa, managed care policies and setting priorities, the pharmaceutical and direct-to-consumer genetics industries, the deaf community and cochlear implants, bioterrorism and public responses to threat, and public health obligations in response to war/mass trauma. The goal is to enable students to develop an analytical approach and methodologies that have practical applications for their future work.

The major ethical theories examined include: utilitarianism, autonomy-centered theories, human rights, theories of distributive justice, social justice and communitarianism. Readings will present distinct, often conflicting ethical approaches to each case. During each session, students will combine these approaches to analyze cases. Each week will also include some didactic component addressing the ethical foundations of the conflicts. The course is designed to systematically build skills of ethical analysis, each week building on previous weeks. The last several meetings of the course are devoted to student paper presentations and discussion.

Requirements:

- **Participation in class discussion**
- **Weekly readings**
- **Discussion board participation: use the discussion questions to write a comment or thought about each week's readings and topics. Your post may be a response to a classmate.**
- **1-page proposal for term paper by week 9**
- **10-12 page term paper on an ethical issue in public health**
- **Presentation of paper to class**

Required Readings & Deadlines

Week 1 (1/18) - Overview of Ethical Frameworks

Required:

1. Watch Video: “Overview of Ethical Frameworks”
 2. Read: Nuffield Council on Ethics, *Public health: Ethical Issues*, London, 2007. Chapter 2, “An ethical framework”, pp.11-28
-

Week 2 (1/25) - Value Pluralism: Fundamental Challenge to Ethical Reasoning

Required:

1. Read Davis, D. S., “Genetic Dilemmas and the Child’s Right to an Open Future”. *Hastings Center Report*, 1997. 27(2): p. 7-15
 2. Read Freedman & Stulberg (2013) "Conflicts in Care for Obstetric Complications in Catholic Hospitals", *AJOB Primary Research*, 4:4, 1-10, DOI: 10.1080/21507716.2012.751464
 3. Watch *Sound and Fury* Film, PBS.
-

Week 3 (2/1) - What we owe individuals: Balancing Autonomy and Beneficence/Paternalism

Required:

1. Watch video: “Pubic Health Interventions: Autonomy vs Paternalism”
2. Read the *Dollar-a-day case*

3. Read Beauchamp, T. L. and Childress, J.F., *Principles of Biomedical Ethics*, 1994, NY: Oxford Univ., “Autonomy,” pp 67-112, reread pps 71-79.

Week 4 (2/8) - Ethical Theories: Utilitarianism/Consequentialism and Deontology

Required:

Beauchamp, T. L. and Childress, J.F., *Principles of Biomedical Ethics*, “Types of Ethical Theory”, 1994, NY: Oxford Univ. Press, pp 25-62, reread pp 25-44.

Week 5 (2/15) - Coercion and Treating Infectious Disease: Utilitarianism vs. Human Rights (taught by Jen Karlin)

Required:

1. Bayer, Ronald, “[Ethics and Infections Disease Control: STD’s, HIV, TB](#)”
2. Mann, J.M. “Medicine and Public Health”, *Ethics and Rights, in Health and Human Rights: A Reader*, J.M. Mann, et. al., eds. 1999, Routledge: New York.p.439-452.
3. *Universal Declaration of Human Rights, in Health and Human Rights; A Reader*, J.M. Mann, et al., Editors. 1999, Routledge: New York. p.453-457.

Week 6 (2/22) - Health Care Rationing: Distributive Justice vs Utilitarianism, the role of fairness and social disparities

Required:

1. View video: “Utilitarianism vs. Distributive Justice.”
 2. Daniels, N., “Four Unsolved Rationing Problems. A Challenge”. *Hastings Center Report*, 1994. 24(4): p. 27-42
-

Week 7 (3/1) - Ethical Obligations in International Research: Vulnerable Communities and Human Rights

Required:

1. Gostin, L. and J.M. Mann, *Towards the development of a human rights impact assessment for the formulation and evaluation of public health policies*, in *Health and Human Rights; A Reader*, J.M. Mann, et al., Editors. 1999, Routledge: New York. p.54-72.
 2. *Universal Declaration of Human Rights*, in *Health and Human Rights; A Reader*, J.M. Mann, et al., Editors. 1999, Routledge: New York. p.453-457. (review, previously read in week 3/13)
 3. Annas, G.J., *Human rights and health--the Universal Declaration of Human Rights at 50*. *NEJM*1998.339(24): p.1778-81.
 4. Angell, M., *The ethics of clinical research in the Third World [editorial; comment]* *New England Journal of Medicine*, 1997.337(12): p.847-9.
 5. Bayer, R., *The debate over maternal-fetal HIV transmission prevention trials in Africa, Asia, and the Caribbean: racist exploitation or exploitation of racism?* *American Journal of Public Health*, 1998.88(4): p.567-70.
 6. Annas, G.J. and M.A. Grodin, *Human rights and maternal-fetal HIV transmission prevention trials in Africa*. *American Journal of Public Health*, 1998.88(4): p.560-3.
 7. Karim, S., *Placebo controls in HIV perinatal transmission trials: a South African's viewpoint*. *American Journal of Public Health*, 1998.88(4): p. 565-566.
 8. Read Case Study: *International AZT Trials*
-

Week 8 (3/8) - Promissory Technology and Ethics: The Precautionary Principle and its Limits

Required:

1. Read CRISPR Germline Engineering—The Community Speaks (2015)
 2. Read <https://www.theguardian.com/science/2015/dec/02/why-human-gene-editing-must-not-be-stopped>
 3. Watch <http://nationalacademies.org/gene-editing/consensus-study/>
-

Week 9 (3/15) Social Justice: Inclusion and Exclusion

Required:

1. Buchanan, Brock, Daniels, Wikler, *From Chance to Choice, Genetics and Justice*, New York: Cambridge University Press, 2000, pp.284-303
 2. Blacksher, E. “Children’s Health Inequalities, Ethical and Political Challenges to Seeking Social Justice”, *Hastings Center Report*, July-August 2008, 38(4), pp.28-35.
 3. **Paper outline due this week: bring with you to class**
-

Week 10 (3/22) - Dehumanizing “the other”: fear in war, bioterrorism, pandemics

Required:

1. Ronald Bayer, James Colgrove, “Rights and Dangers: Bioterrorism and the Ideologies of Public Health,” in Jonathan Moreno, ed. *In the Wake of Terror: Medicine and Morality in a Time of Crisis* (Boston: MIT Press, 2003).

2. Lawrence O. Gostin, "Public Health Law in an Age of Terrorism: Rethinking Individual Rights and Common Goods," *Health Affairs* 21(2002): 79-93.
3. George J. Annas, "Bioterrorism, Public Health, and Civil Liberties," *New England Journal of Medicine* 346 (2002): 1337-1342.
4. Halpern, J. and Weinstein, H. "Rehumanizing the Other: Empathy and Reconciliation", *Human Rights Quarterly*, August 2004, Volume 26, number 3, pp 561-583.
5. *The Model State Emergency Health Powers Act*, October 2001.

.....

Week 11 (3/29) - Spring Break

Week 12 (4/5) - OPEN

Week 13, 14, 15 (4/12-19-26) - Student Paper Presentations

Week 16 (5/4) – FINAL PAPER DUE, SUBMIT ON BCOURSES