

University of Massachusetts
School of Public Health & Health Sciences
Ethical Issues in Public Health



University of
Massachusetts
Amherst

Syllabus

Course Number	HPP 525
Course Name	Ethical Issues in Public Health
Semester Hours	3
Meeting Times	online
Instructor	Daniel M. Goldstein, Ph.D.
Contact email	dmgoldst@schoolph.umass.edu
Office Hours	By appointment

COURSE DESCRIPTION

Public health ethics presents some of the most intriguing and perplexing issues facing the country and the world today. This course introduces and explores public health ethics through the methods and principles of contemporary bioethics. The differences between public health ethics and medical ethics will be stressed. Students will learn about ethical theory and will use this framework to address some of the important ethical issues in public health, including ethical research in public health; ethics and infectious disease control; ethics of health promotion and disease prevention; the ethics of public health emergencies; questions in public health genetics, and public health concerns with social justice. Critical reading, philosophical analysis and group discussion is emphasized.

COURSE OBJECTIVES & OUTCOMES

Drawing on the skills specified in the Core Competencies for Public Health Professionals, adopted by the Council on Linkages between Academia and Public Health Practice, objectives for this course are designed so that the student:

- Develops a lifelong commitment to rigorous critical thinking.
- Creates a culture of ethical standards within organizations and communities.
- Listens to others in an unbiased manner, respects points of view of others, and promotes the expression of diverse opinions and perspectives.
- Collects, summarizes, and interprets information relevant to an issue.

In addition to those general competencies, after successful completion of this course, students will be able to:

1 - articulate the main ethical theories and their philosophical representatives; this will be accomplished by the completion of assignments.

2 - demonstrate an ability to identify ethical dilemmas; this will be accomplished by the completion of discussions and the final exam.

3 - identify and explain ethical principles and understand their function in the discourse of public health ethics; this will be accomplished by the completion of assignments and the final exam.

4 - demonstrate familiarity with the nature and scope of contemporary public health ethics, including its distinction from medical ethics; this will be accomplished by the completion of assignments and discussions.

TEXT

REQUIRED

Public Health Ethics 2nd edition
Stephan Holland
Polity Press 2014

SUGGESTED

Public health ethics: theory, policy, and practice,
edited by Ronald Bayer [et al.],
Oxford University Press US, 2007
ISBN 0195180852, 9780195180855

There will be weekly links to required and supplemental readings, lecture notes and slides and pertinent web sites.

EVALUATION

Weekly Discussions **50%**

 Original post 25%

 Response 25%

Assignments **30%**

Final Project **20%**

Discussion

The first requirement is a conversation. Each module will have an asynchronous discussion based primarily on the readings of the week. Your original post should be in by Thursday to give members of your group time to read and respond to your post. A response is due by Sunday at midnight.

Assignment

This requirement comprises 2 research papers involving an exploration of a specific aspect of Public Health Ethics: Assignment 1 is due October 9 – Theoretical foundations: What is Public Health Ethics; Assignment 2 is due November 6 – Identify and evaluate an issue. Choose from the following:

1. Should public health be political?
2. Should paternalism be the foundation for public health interventions?
3. Should Libertarian Paternalism be considered in promoting the public's health?
4. Should public health research be objective?
5. Should informed consent be required in all public health research?
6. Should parents be allowed to refuse vaccinations for their children?
7. Should practitioners be required to treat during a public health emergency?
8. Should genetic technologies be used for public health interventions?

If there is another issue you would like to present please submit the topic for approval.

Final Project

The final requirement is a comprehensive final paper exploring one specific public health issue using the theoretical elements of the course. The two assignments are the drafts for this final project.

GRADING SCALE

- A 94 and over
- A- 90-93
- B+ 87-89
- B 83-86
- B- 80-82
- C+ 77-79
- C 73-76
- F 72 and below

CLASSROOM DECORUM

A classroom is a community -- even an online classroom. We will be together for the next 6 weeks and during that time we will get to know each other, maybe even more than we might like. Because thinking about ethics brings us to our fundamental assumptions, this class has the potential to become personal. In our community respect will be the first order of business. It is essential that we respect the ideas and beliefs of others. We are not trying to be right by proving others wrong: studying ethics is to belong to a community of researchers exploring ideas and by virtue of being in the class, we are all now part of this community.

There are two important elements to keep in mind:

Respectful interaction: know when to jump in and when to hold back

Helpful participation: be mindful of others and their expression of ideas

ACADEMIC HONESTY AND INTEGRITY POLICY

Academic honesty is expected and required of all UMass students. As stated in the University's Academic Honesty Policy on page 7 of the [Academic Regulations](#) online resource: "Intellectual honesty requires that students demonstrate their own learning during examinations and other academic exercises, and that other sources of information or knowledge be appropriately credited. Scholarship depends upon the reliability of information and reference in the work of others. No form of cheating, plagiarism, fabrication, or facilitating of dishonesty will be condoned in the University community."

Please familiarize yourself with the University's policies and regulations:

(<http://www.umass.edu/registrar/media/academicregs.pdf>)

(http://www.umass.edu/dean_students/downloads/AcademicHonestyPolicy.pdf)

(http://www.umass.edu/dean_students/codeofconduct/acadhonesty)

Our class uses turnitin.com to collect submissions of assignments, papers, and exams. This online "plagiarism prevention service" compares submissions with billions of websites and other student papers. It issues "originality reports" with a percentage score – the higher the score, the less original the submission. This service may be used by students to verify citations as I set it up to allow resubmissions up until the due date. You might want to submit your work at least one day before the due date to verify your originality report. ***If the score of your originality report is over 40% and not cited properly, you will be asked to resubmit the work. If you choose not to resubmit, the grade for the submission will be 0.***

As a condition of continued enrollment in this course, you agree to submit your work to the Turnitin for textual comparison or originality review for the detection of possible plagiarism. All submitted assignments will be included in the UMass Amherst dedicated database of assignments at Turnitin and will be used solely for the purpose of checking for possible plagiarism during the grading process and during this term and in the future.

ACCOMMODATION POLICY

The University of Massachusetts Amherst is committed to providing an equal educational opportunity for all students. If you have a documented physical, psychological, or learning disability on file with Disability Services (DS), Learning Disabilities Support Services (LDSS), or Psychological Disabilities Services (PDS), you may be eligible for reasonable academic accommodations to help you succeed in this course. If you have a documented disability that requires an accommodation, please notify me during the first week of the class so that we may make appropriate arrangements.

COURSE OUTLINE

Week	Dates	Topic	Readings	Assessment
Week 1	9.6 – 9.11	Module 1: Public health and the Love of Wisdom	Online readings	Discussion 1
Week 2	9.12 – 9.18	Module 2: The science of ethics	pp. 1 - 36	Discussion 2
Week 3	9.19 – 9.25	Module 3: Principles -- the language of ethics	pp. 37 - 56	Discussion 3
Week 4	9.26 – 10.2	Module 4: Police power & Paternalism	pp. 57 – 76	Discussion 4
Week 5	10.3 – 10.9	Module 5: Epidemiology I	pp. 77 – 86	Discussion 5 Assignment 1
Week 6	10.10 – 10.16	Module 6: Epidemiology II	pp. 87 - 110	Discussion 6
Week 7	10.17 – 10.23	Module 7: Health promotion	pp. 111 - 134	Discussion 7
Week 8	10.24 – 10.30	Module 8: Health promotion II	pp. 135 - 159	Discussion 8
Week 9	10.31 – 11.6	Module 9: Immunization	pp. 160 - 187	Discussion 9 Assignment 2
Week 10	11.7 – 11.13	Module 10: Public health emergencies	Online readings	Discussion 10
Week 11	11.14 – 11.20	Module 11: Public health genetics	Online readings	Discussion 11
Week 12	11.21 – 11.27	Thanksgiving Break		
Week 13	11.28 – 12.4	Module 12: Social justice	Online readings	Discussion 12
Week 14	12.5 – 12.11	Module 14: Public health and the environment	Online readings	Discussion 13
	12.12 – 12.14	Final Project due 12.18		

In the interests of enhancing this course and the students' learning experience, the instructor reserves the right to make unannounced changes to this syllabus.

Module 1

- Stephen Holland *Public Health Ethics* Introduction, pp 1 - 10.
- H. Tristram Engelhardt, Jr. "From Philosophy and Medicine to Philosophy of Medicine," *The Journal of Medicine and Philosophy* (1986) 11(1): 3-8
- Plato, "The Allegory of the Cave." Book 7, *The Republic*

Module 2

- Stephen Holland *Public Health Ethics*, "Chapters 1 & 2" pp. 11 - 47.
- Ronald Bayer, Amy L. Fairchild "The Genesis of Public Health Ethics" *Bioethics*, November 2004 18(6): 473–492.
- Lisa M. Lee, "Public Health Ethics Theory: Review and Path to Convergence," 40 *J.L. Med. & Ethics* 85 (2012)
- Ursula K. LeGuin "The Ones Who Walk Away from Omelas," by

Supplementary texts (Classics of moral philosophy, not required):

John Stuart Mill Utilitarianism

Jeremy Bentham Introduction to the Principles of Morals and Legislation

W.D.Ross *The Right and the Good*

Immanuel Kant *Fundamental Principles of the Metaphysic Of Morals*

Module 3

- Stephen Holland *Public Health Ethics*, "Chapter 3, pp. 48 - 62.
- Stephen Toulmin, "The Tyranny of Principles" *The Hastings Center Report*, 1981 11 (6): 31-39.
- Kurt Vonnegut, "Harrison Bergeron."

Methods of bioethics *Supplementary*

- James F Childress, *Principles-Oriented Bioethics: An analysis and assessment from within,* *A Matter of Principles?: Ferment in U.S. Bioethics*, ER. DuBose, RP. Hamel, LJ. O'Connell [Eds] Trinity Press International, 1994 72-98.
- Raymond J Devettere, "The Principled Approach: Principles, rules, and actions," *Meta Medical Ethics*, MA Grodin [ed], Kluwer Academic Publishers, 1995, 27-47.
- Mark Kuczewski, "Casuistry and principlism: The convergence of method in biomedical ethics," *Theoretical Medicine and Bioethics*, 1998 19 (6): 509-524.
- Stephen Toulmin, "Casuistry and Clinical Ethics," *A Matter of Principles?: Ferment in U.S. Bioethics*, ER. DuBose, RP. Hamel, LJ. O'Connell [Eds] Trinity Press International, 1994 310 - 318.
- Paul Cudney, "What really separates casuistry from principlism in biomedical ethics," *Theoretical Medicine and Bioethics* (2014) 35:205–229.
- Albert R. Jonsen, "Casuistry," *Methods in Medical Ethics*, J Sugarman DP Sulmasy [eds] Georgetown University Press, 2001 104-125.
- Martha Montello, "Medical Stories: Narrative and Phenomenological approaches," *Meta Medical Ethics*, MA Grodin [ed], Kluwer Academic Publishers, 1995, 109-123.
- Rita Charon, "Narrative Contributions to Medical Ethics," *A Matter of Principles?: Ferment in U.S. Bioethics*, ER. DuBose, RP. Hamel, LJ. O'Connell [Eds] Trinity Press International, 1994 260-283.

- Ronald H Mckinney, "The new casuistry vs. narrative ethics: A postmodern analysis," *Philosophy Today*; Winter 1995; 39, 4; 331-344
- Al Jonsen "Casuistry in Clinical Ethics," *Theoretical Medicine* 7 (1986), 65–74.

Module 4

- Stephen Holland *Public Health Ethics*, "Chapter 4, pp. 63 - 79.
- Childress, et. al., "Public Health Ethics: Mapping the Terrain" *The Journal of Law, Medicine & Ethics* 2002 30(2):1073-1105.
- Buchanan, David R. "Autonomy, Paternalism, and Justice: Ethical Priorities in Public Health" *Am J Public Health* 2008 98: 15-21.
- Brown LD. The political face of public health. *Public Health Reviews* 2010;32:155-173.
- Dostoyevski, Fyodor, "The Grand Inquisitor," *The Brothers Karamazov*

Supplementary

- Beauchamp, Dan, "Community: The Neglected Tradition of Public Health," *Hastings Center Report* 15(6): December 1985, 28-36.
- Dworkin, Gerald, "Paternalism," *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Fall 2008 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.),
- Piper, Mark, "Autonomy: Normative," *The Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy*

Module 5

- *Public Health Ethics*, "Introduction to Part II" and "Chapter 5" pp. 83 - 108.
- Buchanan D. R. and Miller F. G., "A Public Health Perspective on Research Ethics" *Journal of Medical Ethics*, (Dec., 2006) 32, (12): 729-733.
- Taylor, Holly A. and Johnson, Summer, "Ethics of Population-Based Research," *The Journal of Law, Medicine & Ethics*. (Summer2007) 35(2): 295-299.
- N Krieger, "Questioning epidemiology: objectivity, advocacy, and socially responsible science," *American Journal of Public Health* (August 1999) 89 (8): 1151-1153.
- Steven S. Coughlin, "Ethics in Epidemiology at the End of the 20th Century: Ethics, Values, and Mission Statements," *Epidemiol Rev* (2000) 22 (1): 169-175

Module 6

- Lisa M. Lee, et al., "Ethical Justification for Conducting Public Health Surveillance Without Patient Consent," *American Journal of Public Health*, January 2012, Vol. 102, No.1, pp. 38-44.
- Mary L. Cummings, "Informed Consent and Investigational New Drug Abuses in the U.S. Military," *Accountability in Research*, June 2002, Vol. 9, No.2, pp. 93-103.
- Alexander M. Capron, "Protection of Research Subjects: Do Special Rules Apply in Epidemiology?" *Law, medicine & health care*, (1991) Vol. 19, pp. 184-190.
- Loretta M. Kopelman, "Children as Research Subjects: A Dilemma ", *Journal of Medicine and Philosophy* 2000, Vol. 25, No. 6, pp. 745–764

Module 7

- Stephen Holland *Public Health Ethics*, "Chapter 6," pp. 109 - 132.
- Carter et al, "Evidence, Ethics, and Values: A Framework for Health Promotion," *American Journal of Public Health*, March 2011, Vol 101, No. 3, pp. 465-472.
- John Rossi, Michael Yudell, "The Use of Persuasion in Public Health Communication: An Ethical Critique," *Public Health Ethics*, 2012 Vol 5, No. 2, pp. 192–205.
- Per-Anders Tengland, "Behavior Change or Empowerment: On the Ethics of Health-Promotion Strategies," *Public Health Ethics*, 2012 Vol 5, No. 2, pp. 140–153.

Module 8

- Stephen Holland *Public Health Ethics*, "Chapters 7 & 8," pp. 133 - 185.
- Richard H. Thaler, Cass R. Sunstein, "Libertarian Paternalism Is Not an Oxymoron," *University of Chicago Law Review*, Fall 2003, Vol. 70, pp 1159-1202
- George Loewenstein, et al., "Asymmetric Paternalism to Improve Health Behaviors," 2007;298(20):2415-2417
- Jean-Frederick Menard, "A 'Nudge' for Public Health Ethics: Libertarian Paternalism as a Framework for Ethical Analysis of Public Health Interventions?" *Public Health Ethics* 2010, Vol. 3, No. 3, pp. 229–238
- Gregory Mitchell, "LIBERTARIAN PATERNALISM IS AN OXYMORON," *Northwestern University Law Review*. Spring 2005, Vol. 99 Issue 3, p1245-1277

Supplementary

- Thomas Ploug, et. al., "To nudge or not to nudge: cancer screening programmes and the limits of libertarian paternalism," *J Epidemiol Community Health* 2012;66:1193–1196
- Eliza Shapiro "The Unintended Consequences of Company Wellness Penalties" *The Daily Beast*, July 6, 2013

Module 9

- Stephen Holland *Public Health Ethics*, "Chapter 9, pp. 186 - 210.
- Maggie Koerth-Baker, "Values and Vaccines" *Aeon Media Group Ltd.* 2012-2017
- El-Amin AN, Parra MT, Kim-Farley R, Fielding JE. Ethical issues concerning vaccination requirements. *Public Health Reviews*. 2012;34: epub ahead of print.
- KEVIN M. MALONE AND ALAN R. HINMAN, "Vaccination Mandates: The Public Health Imperative and Individual Rights."
- Al Jonsen, Do No Harm, *Annals of Internal Medicine*, (1978) Vol 88, pp. 827 – 832

Module 10

- Daniels, N "Duty to Treat or Right to Refuse?" *The Hastings Center Report*, 21.2 (Mar 1991): 36-46.
- Malm, Heidi, et al., "Ethics, Pandemics, and the Duty to Treat," *The American Journal of Bioethics*, 8(8): 4–19, 2008
- Howard Brody and Eric N. Avery, "Medicine's Duty to Treat Pandemic Illness: Solidarity and Vulnerability," *Hastings Center Report* Volume 39, Number 1, January-February 2009
- C.P. van der Weijden, A.L. Bredenoord, J.J.M. van Delden, "The duty to treat in the context of an influenza pandemic," *Vaccine*, Volume 28, Issue 32, 19 July 2010, Pages 5260–5264

Supplementary

- Sorell, Tom, "Morality and Emergency" Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society, Sep2002, Vol. 103 Issue 1, p21. 17p.
- World Health Organization, "Addressing ethical issues in pandemic influenza planning."
- University of Toronto Joint Centre for Bioethics, "Stand on Guard for Thee: Addressing ethical issues in pandemic influenza planning."
- CDC, "Zombie Preparedness Plan."

Module 11

- Stephen Holland *Public Health Ethics*, "Chapter 10, pp. 211 - 241.
- Hodge, James, "Ethical issues concerning genetic testing and screening in public health," American Journal of Medical Genetics. Part C, Seminars in medical genetics (2004) vol:125C iss:1 pg:66 -70
- Wang, Grace "The role of genetics in the provision of essential public health services." American Journal of Public Health, (2007) vol:97 iss:4 pg:620 -5
- Omenn, G S, "Public health genetics: an emerging interdisciplinary field for the post-genomic era," Annual Review of Public Health (2000) vol:21 pg:1 -13

Supplementary

- Hinton, Cynthia, "Ethical implications and practical considerations of ethnically targeted screening for genetic disorders: the case of hemoglobinopathy screening," Ethnicity & health (2011) vol:16 iss:4-5 pg:377 -88.
- Nelson, R M, "Ethical issues with genetic testing in pediatrics" Pediatrics (2001) vol:107 iss:6 pg:1451 - 1455
- Görman, Ulf, "Ethical issues raised by personalized nutrition based on genetic information," Genes & Nutrition (2006) vol:1 iss:1 pg:13 -22

Module 12

- Sridhar Venkatapuram and Michael Marmot, "Epidemiology and Social Justice," Bioethics Volume 23 Number 2 2009 pp 79–89
- Paula A. Braveman et al, "Health Disparities and Health Equity: The Issue Is Justice," American Journal of Public Health, 2011, Vol 101, No. S1
- Margaret Whitehead, "The Concepts and Principles of Equity and Health," Health Promotion International, vol. 6, No.3, 1991
- Dan Beauchamp, "Public Health as Social Justice,"
- Powers and Faden, Chapter 4 "Social Justice and Public Health,"

Module 13

- Anthony Kessel and Carolyn Stephens "Environment, ethics and public health: The climate change dilemma," Chapter 9 *Public Health Ethics*, ed. Angus Dawson. Cambridge University Press 2011.